## **EXHIBIT 51**

1

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ILLINOIS EASTERN DIVISION

XAVIER WALKER,

Plaintiff,

vs.

No. 20 CV 7209

CITY OF CHICAGO, et al.,

Defendants.

The discovery deposition of ROBERT BARTIK, called by the Plaintiff for examination, taken pursuant to notice and pursuant to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure for the United States District Courts pertaining to the taking of depositions, taken before Donna Wadlington Shavers, a Certified Shorthand Reporter, taken remotely via Zoom, Chicago, Illinois, on the 15th day of June, 2022, commencing at the hour of 10:00 a.m.

1					
2 APPEARANCES: 3 SAMUELS & ASSOCIATES, LTD. 5 BY: JEANETTE SAMUELS, ESQ. 6 S3 West Jackson Boulevard, Suite 831 7 Chicago, Illinois 60604 8 (872) SSR-8726 9 sam@chicivilrights.com 10 Appeared on behalf of the Plaintiff. 11 12 12 13 NATHAN & KAMIONSKI, LLP 14 BY: NATALIE ADEEYO, ESQ. 15 BREANA BRILL, ESQ. 16 NEHA LOCKE, ESQ. 17 33 West Monroe Street, Suite 1830 19 (312) 612-2255 19 anadecyo@nklawllp.com 20 mlocke@nklawllp.com 21 bbrill@nklawllp.com 22 nlocke@nklawllp.com 23 Appeared on behalf of the Defendants. 24 DSOWN MISHA ITCHHAPORIA, ESQ. 5 Two First National Plaza 20 South Clark Street, Suite 1700 7 Chicago, Illinois 60603 8 (312) 580-1030 9 gmiller@borkanscahill.com 10 mitchhaporia@borkanscahill.com 11 Appeared on behalf of the Defendant, 12 Robert A. Bartik. 13 Also present: 14 Also present: 15 Mr. Ethan Fox 16 Mr. Ethan Fox 17 (Are Yes. 22 (A. Also or seven. 23 Appeared on behalf of the Defendant, 24 Also present: 25 (A. Robert, Ro-be-r-t, Bartik, 26 (B. Caryou please state and spell your name for the record. 27 (A. Robert, Ro-be-r-t, Bartik, 28 (B. Caryou please state and greenment of the parties under all applicable rules. 24 (B. Cross by Mr. Miller 128 (Cross by Mr. Miller 129 (No exhibits were marked.) 11 11 (No exhibits were marked.) 11 12 (No exhibits were marked.) 12 (No exhibits were marked.) 13 (No exhibits were marked.) 14 (No exhibits were marked.) 15 (No exhibits were marked.) 16 (No exhibits were marked.) 17 (Witness duly sworn.) 18 (Witness duly sworn.) 18 (Witness duly sworn.) 19 (Witness duly sworn.) 20 (Dienet Bartik Rate of Dienet		2			4
2 APPEARANCES: 3 SAMUELS & ASSOCIATES, LTD. 5 BY: JEANETTE SAMUELS, ESQ. 6 S3 West Jackson Boulevard, Suite 831 7 Chicago, Illinois 60604 8 (872) SSR-8726 9 sam@chicivilrights.com 10 Appeared on behalf of the Plaintiff. 11 12 12 13 NATHAN & KAMIONSKI, LLP 14 BY: NATALIE ADEEYO, ESQ. 15 BREANA BRILL, ESQ. 16 NEHA LOCKE, ESQ. 17 33 West Monroe Street, Suite 1830 19 (312) 612-2255 19 anadecyo@nklawllp.com 20 mlocke@nklawllp.com 21 bbrill@nklawllp.com 22 nlocke@nklawllp.com 23 Appeared on behalf of the Defendants. 24 DSOWN MISHA ITCHHAPORIA, ESQ. 5 Two First National Plaza 20 South Clark Street, Suite 1700 7 Chicago, Illinois 60603 8 (312) 580-1030 9 gmiller@borkanscahill.com 10 mitchhaporia@borkanscahill.com 11 Appeared on behalf of the Defendant, 12 Robert A. Bartik. 13 Also present: 14 Also present: 15 Mr. Ethan Fox 16 Mr. Ethan Fox 17 (Are Yes. 22 (A. Also or seven. 23 Appeared on behalf of the Defendant, 24 Also present: 25 (A. Robert, Ro-be-r-t, Bartik, 26 (B. Caryou please state and spell your name for the record. 27 (A. Robert, Ro-be-r-t, Bartik, 28 (B. Caryou please state and greenment of the parties under all applicable rules. 24 (B. Cross by Mr. Miller 128 (Cross by Mr. Miller 129 (No exhibits were marked.) 11 11 (No exhibits were marked.) 11 12 (No exhibits were marked.) 12 (No exhibits were marked.) 13 (No exhibits were marked.) 14 (No exhibits were marked.) 15 (No exhibits were marked.) 16 (No exhibits were marked.) 17 (Witness duly sworn.) 18 (Witness duly sworn.) 18 (Witness duly sworn.) 19 (Witness duly sworn.) 20 (Dienet Bartik Rate of Dienet	1		1	INDEX	
SAMUELS & ASSOCIATES, LTD.   5   BY: JEANETTE SAMUELS, ESQ.   5   5   Wr. Miller   128		APPEAR ANCES:		TNDLA	
SAMUELS & ASSOCIATES, LTD.   5   BY: JEANETTE SAMUELS, ESQ.   5   53   West Jackson Boulevard, Suite 831   6   6   7   7   6   6   7   7   8   6872   588-726   8   8   8   7   7   7   7   7   7   7		ALI LARANCES.		DODEDT DADTIV DACE	7
5   BY: JEANETTE SAMUELS, ESQ.   5   Cross by Mr. Miller   128		CAMIEIC & ACCOCIATES LTD			
6 53 West Jackson Boulevard, Suite 831 7 Chicago, Illinois 60604 (872) 588-8726 9 sam@chicivilrights.com 10 Appeared on behalf of the Plaintiff. 11 12 13 NATHAN & KAMIONSKI, LLP 14 BY: NATALIE ADEEYO, ESQ. 15 BREANA BRILL, ESQ. 16 NEHA LOCKE, ESQ. 17 33 West Monroe Street, Suite 1830 17 Chicago, Illinois 60603 18 Chicago, Illinois 60603 19 (312) 612-2255 20 nadecyo@nklawllp.com 21 bbbrill@nklawllp.com 22 plobek@nklawllp.com 23 Appeared on behalf of the Defendants. 24 25 BORKAN & SCAHILL, LTD. 26 BY: GRAHAM MILLER, ESQ. 37 MISHA TICHHAPORIA, ESQ. 47 MISHA TICHHAPORIA, ESQ. 58 (312) 580-1030 9 gmiller@borkanscahill.com 10 mitchhaporia@borkanscahill.com 11 Appeared on behalf of the Defendant, 12 Robert A. Bartik. 13 Also present: 14 Also present: 15 Mr. Drew Wycoff 16 Mr. Ethan Fox 17 Mr. Ethan Fox 18 BY MS. SAMUELS: 19 Universal deposition of Robert Bartik taken in the case of Xavier Walker versus City of Chicago, et la. 19 MS. SAMUELS: All right. This is the deposition of Robert Bartik taken in the case of Xavier Walker versus City of Chicago, et la. 19 Mr. Drew Wycoff 10 Mr. Ethan Fox 10 Mr. Ethan Fox 11 Mr. Drew Wycoff 12 Mr. Ethan Fox 13 MATHAN & KAMIONSKI, LLP 14 BY: NATALIE ADEEYO, ESQ. 15 MEHA LOCKE, ESQ. 16 Natha Locke, Suite 1830 17 (Witness duly sworn.) 18 (Witness duly sworn.) 19 (Witness duly sworn.) 10 (Witness duly sworn.) 11 (Witness duly sworn.) 12 (Witness duly sworn.) 12 (Witness duly sworn.) 13 (Alcaled as a witness herein, having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows: 14 Also present: 15 Mr. Drew Wycoff 16 Mr. Ethan Fox 17 (A. Robert R-o-b-e-t-t, Bartik,  18 B-a-t-t-i-k. 19 MS. SAMUELS: 19 MS. SAMUELS: 19 MS. SAMUELS: 19 Q. And about how many times? 20 A. Six or seven.		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			
7				Cross by Mr. Miller 128	
8		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			
9   sam@chicivilrights.com   9   EXHIBITS					
10					
1					
12	10	Appeared on behalf of the Plaintiff.	10	(No exhibits were marked.)	
13	11		11		
14 BY: NATALIE ADEEYO, ESQ. 15 BREANA BRILL, ESQ. 16 NEHA LOCKE, ESQ. 17 33 West Monroe Street, Suite 1830 18 Chicago, Illinois 60603 19 (312) 612-2255 20 nadeeyo@nklawllp.com 21 bbrill@nklawllp.com 22 nlocke@nklawllp.com 23 Appeared on behalf of the Defendants. 24 24  25 BORKAN & SCAHILL, LTD. 26 BORKAN & SCAHILL, LTD. 27 BORKAN MISHA ITCHHAPORIA, ESQ. 28 MISHA ITCHHAPORIA, ESQ. 29 Two First National Plaza 20 South Clark Street, Suite 1700 20 Chicago, Illinois 60603 21 Gardina Plaza 21 BORKAN & SCAHILL, LTD. 22 BORKAN & SCAHILL, LTD. 23 BY: GRAHAM MILLER, ESQ. 24 BORKAN & SCAHILL, LTD. 25 BORKAN & SCAHILL, LTD. 26 BORKAN & SCAHILL, LTD. 27 BORKAN & SCAHILL, LTD. 28 BORKAN & SCAHILL, LTD. 29 Gran MISHA ITCHHAPORIA, ESQ. 20 South Clark Street, Suite 1700 21 Chicago, Illinois 60603 23 (312) 580-1030 24 Can you please state and spell your name for the record. 26 A. Robert, R-o-b-e-r-t, Bartik, 27 Ba-ar-t-i-k. 28 BY MS. SAMUELS: All right. This is the deposition of Robert Bartik taken in the case of Xavier Walker versus City of Chicago, et al., 29 Case No. 20 CV 7209. This deposition before, sir? 20 Law you ever given a deposition before, sir? 21 A. Yes. 22 Q. And about how many times? 23 Appeared on behalf of the Defendant, 29 Particular Street Suite 1700 20 Law you ever given a deposition before, sir? 20 A. Yes. 21 A. Yes. 22 Q. And about how many times?	12		12		
15 BREANA BRILL, ESQ. NEHA LOCKE, ESQ. 17 33 West Monroe Street, Suite 1830 Chicago, Illinois 60603 19 (312) 612-2255 19 19 20 nadeey@nklawllp.com 21 bbrill@nklawllp.com 22 nlocke@nklawllp.com 23 Appeared on behalf of the Defendants. 24 24  3 BORKAN & SCAHILL, LTD. 3 BY: GRAHAM MILLER, ESQ. 4 MISHA ITCHHAPORIA, ESQ. 5 Two First National Plaza 6 20 South Clark Street, Suite 1700 7 Chicago, Illinois 60603 (312) 580-1030 9 gmiller@borkanscahill.com nitchhaporia@borkanscahill.com pmitchhaporia@borkanscahill.com Appeared on behalf of the Defendant, Robert A. Bartik. 13 Also present: 15 Mr. Drew Wycoff 16 Mr. Ethan Fox 17 In Drew Wycoff 18 In Drew Wycoff 19 One of Robert Bartik taken in the case of Xavier Walker versus City of Chicago, et al., Case No. 20 CV 7209. This deposition before, sir? 17 In Drew Wycoff 18 In Drew Wycoff 19 One of Robert Bartik taken in the case of Xavier Walker versus City of Chicago, et al., Case No. 20 CV 7209. This deposition before, sir? 18 In Mr. Drew Wycoff 19 One of Robert Bartik taken in the case of Xavier Walker versus City of Chicago, et al., Case No. 20 CV 7209. This deposition before, sir? 20 One of Robert Bartik taken in the case of Xavier Walker versus City of Chicago, et al., Case No. 20 CV 7209. This deposition before, sir? 21 A. Yes. 22 One And about how many times? 23 Appeared on behalf of the Defendant, have been been been been bear of the parties under all applicable rules. 24 Also present: 25 A. Yes. 26 One of Portent of the parties under all applicable rules. 27 A. Yes. 28 One of Ala about how many times? 28 One of Ala about how many times? 29 A. Six or seven.	13	NATHAN & KAMIONSKI, LLP	13		
15 BREANA BRILL, ESQ. NEHA LOCKE, ESQ. 17 33 West Monroe Street, Suite 1830 Chicago, Illinois 60603 19 (312) 612-2255 19 19 20 nadeey@nklawllp.com 21 bbrill@nklawllp.com 22 nlocke@nklawllp.com 23 Appeared on behalf of the Defendants. 24 24  3 BORKAN & SCAHILL, LTD. 3 BY: GRAHAM MILLER, ESQ. 4 MISHA ITCHHAPORIA, ESQ. 5 Two First National Plaza 6 20 South Clark Street, Suite 1700 7 Chicago, Illinois 60603 (312) 580-1030 9 gmiller@borkanscahill.com nitchhaporia@borkanscahill.com pmitchhaporia@borkanscahill.com Appeared on behalf of the Defendant, Robert A. Bartik. 13 Also present: 15 Mr. Drew Wycoff 16 Mr. Ethan Fox 17 In Drew Wycoff 18 In Drew Wycoff 19 One of Robert Bartik taken in the case of Xavier Walker versus City of Chicago, et al., Case No. 20 CV 7209. This deposition before, sir? 17 In Drew Wycoff 18 In Drew Wycoff 19 One of Robert Bartik taken in the case of Xavier Walker versus City of Chicago, et al., Case No. 20 CV 7209. This deposition before, sir? 18 In Mr. Drew Wycoff 19 One of Robert Bartik taken in the case of Xavier Walker versus City of Chicago, et al., Case No. 20 CV 7209. This deposition before, sir? 20 One of Robert Bartik taken in the case of Xavier Walker versus City of Chicago, et al., Case No. 20 CV 7209. This deposition before, sir? 21 A. Yes. 22 One And about how many times? 23 Appeared on behalf of the Defendant, have been been been been bear of the parties under all applicable rules. 24 Also present: 25 A. Yes. 26 One of Portent of the parties under all applicable rules. 27 A. Yes. 28 One of Ala about how many times? 28 One of Ala about how many times? 29 A. Six or seven.	14	BY: NATALIE ADEEYO, ESQ.	14		
16	15				
17 18 Chicago, Illinois 60603 19 (312) 612-2255 20 nadecyo@nklawllp.com 21 bbrill@nklawllp.com 22 nlocke@nklawllp.com 23 Appeared on behalf of the Defendants. 24  30 25 26 27 28 29 29 20 20 20 20 21 21 22 21 22 23 24  30 24  30 25 26 27 28 29 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20					
18 Chicago, Illinois 60603 19 (312) 612-2255 20 nadeeyo@nklawllp.com 21 bbrill@nklawllp.com 22 nlocke@nklawllp.com 23 Appeared on behalf of the Defendants. 24  30  1 BORKAN & SCAHILL, LTD. 3 BY: GRAHAM MILLER, ESQ. 4 MISHA ITCHHAPORIA, ESQ. 5 Two First National Plaza 6 20 South Clark Street, Suite 1700 7 Chicago, Illinois 60603 8 (312) 580-1030 9 gmiller@borkanscahill.com 10 mitchhaporia@borkanscahill.com 11 Robert A. Bartik. 12 Robert A. Bartik. 13 Also present: 14 Also present: 15 Mr. Drew Wycoff 16 Mr. Ethan Fox 17 Mr. Ethan Fox 18 BY MS. SAMUELS: 19 Q. Can you please state and spell your name for the record. 10 A. Robert, R-o-b-e-r-t, Bartik, 11 B-a-t-t-i-k. 12 MS. SAMUELS: All right. This is the deposition of Robert Bartik taken in the case of Xavier Walker versus City of Chicago, et al., Case No. 20 CV 7209. This deposition before, sir? 10 Q. Have you ever given a deposition before, sir? 21 A. Yes. 22 Q. And about how many times? 23 Appeared on behalf of the Defendants, 12 Robert A. Bartik. 24 BORKAN & SCAHILL, LTD. 25 (Witness duly sworn.) 26 (Witness duly sworn.) 26 (Witness duly sworn.) 27 (Witness duly sworn.) 28 (Witness duly sworn.) 29 BOBERT BARTIK, 21 (Witness duly sworn.) 20 BOBERT BARTIK, 21 (Witness duly sworn.) 22 BORKAN & SCAHILL, LTD. 23 ADDERT BARTIK, 24 (Witness duly sworn.) 26 (Witness duly sworn.) 26 (Witness duly sworn.) 28 (Witness duly sworn.) 29 BOBERT BARTIK, 21 (Witness duly sworn.) 20 BOBERT BARTIK, 21 (Witness duly sworn.) 20 (Witness duly sworn.) 22 (A and about how many times? 24 (A Stor seven.)					
19 (312) 612-2255 20 nadeeyo@nklawllp.com 21 bbrill@nklawllp.com 22 nlocke@nklawllp.com 23 Appeared on behalf of the Defendants. 24 23 24 25 25 26 26 27 27 29 27 29 29 29 29 29 29 29 29 29 29 29 29 29					
20					
bbrill@nklawllp.com nlocke@nklawllp.com 22					
22 nlocke@nklawllp.com 3 Appeared on behalf of the Defendants. 24 23 24 25 23 24 26 27 28 28 29 29 29 29 29 29 29 29 29 29 29 20 29 29 29 29 29 29 29 29 29 29 29 29 29					
Appeared on behalf of the Defendants.  23 24  3					
24  3   Comparison of Potential States of the Potential State of the Potential States of States					
1 BORKAN & SCAHILL, LTD. 2 ROBERT BARTIK, 2 Called as a witness herein, having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows: 5 Two First National Plaza 5 Follows: 6 20 South Clark Street, Suite 1700 6 DIRECT EXAMINATION 6 DIRECT EXAMINATION 7 Chicago, Illinois 60603 7 BY MS. SAMUELS: Q. Can you please state and spell your name for the record. 8 Also present: 12 Also present: 14 Also present: 15 Mr. Drew Wycoff 15 Case No. 20 CV 7209. This deposition is taken pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties under all applicable rules. 18 BY MS. SAMUELS: Q. Have you ever given a deposition before, sir? 21 A. Yes. 22 Q. And about how many times? 23 A. Six or seven.		Appeared on behalf of the Defendants.			
1 (Witness duly sworn.) 2 BORKAN & SCAHILL, LTD. 3 BY: GRAHAM MILLER, ESQ. 4 MISHA ITCHHAPORIA, ESQ. 5 Two First National Plaza 6 20 South Clark Street, Suite 1700 7 Chicago, Illinois 60603 8 (312) 580-1030 9 gmiller@borkanscahill.com 10 mitchhaporia@borkanscahill.com 11 Appeared on behalf of the Defendant, 12 Robert A. Bartik. 13 Also present: 14 Also present: 15 Mr. Drew Wycoff 16 Mr. Ethan Fox 17 18 18 19 20 Have you ever given a deposition before, sir? 21 22 23 24 A. Six or seven.	24		24		
1 (Witness duly sworn.) 2 BORKAN & SCAHILL, LTD. 3 BY: GRAHAM MILLER, ESQ. 4 MISHA ITCHHAPORIA, ESQ. 5 Two First National Plaza 6 20 South Clark Street, Suite 1700 7 Chicago, Illinois 60603 8 (312) 580-1030 9 gmiller@borkanscahill.com 10 mitchhaporia@borkanscahill.com 11 Appeared on behalf of the Defendant, 12 Robert A. Bartik. 13 Also present: 14 Also present: 15 Mr. Drew Wycoff 16 Mr. Ethan Fox 17 18 18 19 20 Have you ever given a deposition before, sir? 21 22 23 24 A. Six or seven.					
BORKAN & SCAHILL, LTD. BY: GRAHAM MILLER, ESQ. MISHA ITCHHAPORIA, ESQ. Two First National Plaza Chicago, Illinois 60603 Giller@borkanscahill.com mitchhaporia@borkanscahill.com mitchhaporia@borkanscahill.com Appeared on behalf of the Defendant, Robert A. Bartik.  Also present: Mr. Drew Wycoff Mr. Ethan Fox  BORKAN & SCAHILL, LTD. BY: GRAHAM MILLER, ESQ.  duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows: DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MS. SAMUELS: Q. Can you please state and spell your name for the record. A. Robert, R-o-b-e-r-t, Bartik, B-a-r-t-i-k.  MS. SAMUELS: All right. This is the deposition of Robert Bartik taken in the case of Xavier Walker versus City of Chicago, et al., Case No. 20 CV 7209. This deposition is taken pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties under all applicable rules. BY MS. SAMUELS: Q. Have you ever given a deposition before, sir? A. Yes. Q. And about how many times? A. Six or seven.		3			5
3 BY: GRAHAM MILLER, ESQ. 4 MISHA ITCHHAPORIA, ESQ. 5 Two First National Plaza 6 20 South Clark Street, Suite 1700 7 Chicago, Illinois 60603 8 (312) 580-1030 9 gmiller@borkanscahill.com 10 mitchhaporia@borkanscahill.com 11 Appeared on behalf of the Defendant, 12 Robert A. Bartik. 13 Also present: 14 Also present: 15 Mr. Drew Wycoff 16 Mr. Ethan Fox 17 Universely of the Defendant, 18 Mr. Brank Samuels: 19 Q. Can you please state and spell your 10 name for the record. 11 A. Robert, R-o-b-e-r-t, Bartik, 12 B-a-r-t-i-k. 13 deposition of Robert Bartik taken in the case of 14 Xavier Walker versus City of Chicago, et al., 15 Case No. 20 CV 7209. This deposition is taken 16 pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 17 under all applicable rules. 18 BY MS. SAMUELS: 19 Q. Have you ever given a deposition 20 before, sir? 21 A. Yes. 22 Q. And about how many times? 23 A. Six or seven.	1		1	(Witness duly sworn.)	
3 BY: GRAHAM MILLER, ESQ. 4 MISHA ITCHHAPORIA, ESQ. 5 Two First National Plaza 6 20 South Clark Street, Suite 1700 7 Chicago, Illinois 60603 8 (312) 580-1030 9 gmiller@borkanscahill.com 10 mitchhaporia@borkanscahill.com 11 Appeared on behalf of the Defendant, 12 Robert A. Bartik. 13 Also present: 14 Also present: 15 Mr. Drew Wycoff 16 Mr. Ethan Fox 17 University of the Defendant, 18 BY MS. SAMUELS: 19 University of Chicago, et al., 19 University of Chicago, et al., 10 Case No. 20 CV 7209. This deposition is taken pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties under all applicable rules. 18 BY MS. SAMUELS: 19 Q. Have you ever given a deposition before, sir? 20 A. Yes. 21 Q. And about how many times? 22 Q. And about how many times? 23 A. Six or seven.	2	BORKAN & SCAHILL, LTD.	2	ROBERT BARTIK,	
4 MISHA ITCHHAPORIA, ESQ. 5 Two First National Plaza 6 20 South Clark Street, Suite 1700 7 Chicago, Illinois 60603 8 (312) 580-1030 9 gmiller@borkanscahill.com 10 mitchhaporia@borkanscahill.com 11 Appeared on behalf of the Defendant, 12 Robert A. Bartik. 13 Also present: 14 Also present: 15 Mr. Drew Wycoff 16 Mr. Ethan Fox 17 Case No. 20 CV 7209. This deposition is taken pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties under all applicable rules. 18 BY MS. SAMUELS: 19 Q. Can you please state and spell your name for the record. 10 A. Robert, R-o-b-e-r-t, Bartik, 11 B-a-r-t-i-k. 12 MS. SAMUELS: All right. This is the deposition of Robert Bartik taken in the case of Xavier Walker versus City of Chicago, et al., 15 Case No. 20 CV 7209. This deposition is taken pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties under all applicable rules. 18 BY MS. SAMUELS: 19 Q. Have you ever given a deposition before, sir? 21 A. Yes. 22 Q. And about how many times? 23 A. Six or seven.	3	BY: GRAHAM MILLER, ESQ.	3	called as a witness herein, having been first	
5 Two First National Plaza 6 20 South Clark Street, Suite 1700 7 Chicago, Illinois 60603 8 (312) 580-1030 9 gmiller@borkanscahill.com 10 mitchhaporia@borkanscahill.com 11 Appeared on behalf of the Defendant, 12 Robert A. Bartik. 13 14 Also present: 15 Mr. Drew Wycoff 16 Mr. Ethan Fox 17 18 19 20 21 21 22 23 23 24 3 Follows:  5 follows:  6 DIRECT EXAMINATION  8 PY MS. SAMUELS:  Q. Can you please state and spell your name for the record.  10 4 A. Robert, R-o-b-e-r-t, Bartik,  11 B-a-r-t-i-k. 12 MS. SAMUELS: All right. This is the deposition of Robert Bartik taken in the case of Xavier Walker versus City of Chicago, et al.,  15 Case No. 20 CV 7209. This deposition is taken pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties under all applicable rules.  18 BY MS. SAMUELS:  19 Q. Have you ever given a deposition before, sir?  21 A. Yes. 22 Q. And about how many times?  A. Six or seven.			4		
6 20 South Clark Street, Suite 1700 7 Chicago, Illinois 60603 8 (312) 580-1030 9 gmiller@borkanscahill.com 10 mitchhaporia@borkanscahill.com 11 Appeared on behalf of the Defendant, 12 Robert A. Bartik. 13 Haso present: 14 Also present: 15 Mr. Drew Wycoff 16 Mr. Ethan Fox 17 Drew Wycoff 18 BY MS. SAMUELS: 19 Q. Can you please state and spell your name for the record. 10 A. Robert, R-o-b-e-r-t, Bartik, 11 B-a-r-t-i-k. 12 MS. SAMUELS: All right. This is the deposition of Robert Bartik taken in the case of Xavier Walker versus City of Chicago, et al., 15 Case No. 20 CV 7209. This deposition is taken pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties under all applicable rules. 18 BY MS. SAMUELS: 19 Q. Have you ever given a deposition before, sir? 21 A. Yes. 22 Q. And about how many times? 23 A. Six or seven.			5	•	
Chicago, Illinois 60603  (312) 580-1030  gmiller@borkanscahill.com  mitchhaporia@borkanscahill.com  Appeared on behalf of the Defendant,  Robert A. Bartik.  Also present:  Mr. Drew Wycoff  Mr. Ethan Fox  The Mr. Ethan Fox  BY MS. SAMUELS:  Q. Can you please state and spell your name for the record.  A. Robert, R-o-b-e-r-t, Bartik,  B-a-r-t-i-k.  MS. SAMUELS: All right. This is the deposition of Robert Bartik taken in the case of Xavier Walker versus City of Chicago, et al.,  Case No. 20 CV 7209. This deposition is taken pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties under all applicable rules.  BY MS. SAMUELS:  Q. Have you ever given a deposition before, sir?  A. Yes.  Q. And about how many times?  A. Six or seven.					
8 (312) 580-1030 8 Q. Can you please state and spell your gmiller@borkanscahill.com 10 mitchhaporia@borkanscahill.com 11 Appeared on behalf of the Defendant, 11 B-a-r-t-i-k.  12 Robert A. Bartik. 12 Ms. SAMUELS: All right. This is the deposition of Robert Bartik taken in the case of 14 Also present: 14 Xavier Walker versus City of Chicago, et al., 15 Mr. Drew Wycoff 15 Case No. 20 CV 7209. This deposition is taken 16 pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 17 under all applicable rules. 18 BY Ms. SAMUELS: 19 Q. Have you ever given a deposition before, sir? 18 Q. And about how many times? 19 Q. And about how many times? 20 A. Six or seven.		The state of the s			
9 gmiller@borkanscahill.com 10 mitchhaporia@borkanscahill.com 11 Appeared on behalf of the Defendant, 12 Robert A. Bartik. 13 Ms. SAMUELS: All right. This is the 13 deposition of Robert Bartik taken in the case of 14 Also present: 15 Mr. Drew Wycoff 16 Mr. Ethan Fox 17 Under all applicable rules. 18 BY Ms. SAMUELS: 19 Q. Have you ever given a deposition 19 brank results and applicable to before, sir? 21 A. Yes. 22 Q. And about how many times? 23 A. Six or seven.					
mitchhaporia@borkanscahill.com 1 Appeared on behalf of the Defendant, 1 Robert A. Bartik.  1 Robert A. Bartik.  1 MS. SAMUELS: All right. This is the 1 deposition of Robert Bartik taken in the case of 1 Xavier Walker versus City of Chicago, et al., 1 Case No. 20 CV 7209. This deposition is taken 1 pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 1 under all applicable rules. 1 BY MS. SAMUELS: 1 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 1 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 1 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 1 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 1 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 1 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 1 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 1 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 1 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 1 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 1 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 1 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 2 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 2 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 2 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 2 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 2 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 2 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 2 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 2 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 2 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 2 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 2 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 2 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 2 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 2 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 3 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 3 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 3 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 3 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 3 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 3 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 4 Pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 4					
Appeared on behalf of the Defendant, Robert A. Bartik.  12 MS. SAMUELS: All right. This is the deposition of Robert Bartik taken in the case of Xavier Walker versus City of Chicago, et al., Mr. Drew Wycoff Mr. Ethan Fox  14 Case No. 20 CV 7209. This deposition is taken pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties under all applicable rules.  BY MS. SAMUELS:  18 BY MS. SAMUELS:  19 Q. Have you ever given a deposition before, sir?  21 A. Yes. 22 Q. And about how many times? A. Six or seven.	10		10		
12 Robert A. Bartik.  13 deposition of Robert Bartik taken in the case of 14 Also present: 15 Mr. Drew Wycoff 16 Mr. Ethan Fox 17 under all applicable rules. 18 BY MS. SAMUELS: 19 Q. Have you ever given a deposition 20 before, sir? 21 A. Yes. 22 Q. And about how many times? 23 A. Six or seven.		· ~			
13 deposition of Robert Bartik taken in the case of 14 Also present: 15 Mr. Drew Wycoff 16 Mr. Ethan Fox 17 18 18 18 BY MS. SAMUELS: 19 Q. Have you ever given a deposition 20 before, sir? 21 A. Yes. 22 Q. And about how many times? 23 A. Six or seven.					
Also present:  Mr. Drew Wycoff  Mr. Ethan Fox  14 Xavier Walker versus City of Chicago, et al.,  15 Case No. 20 CV 7209. This deposition is taken  16 pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties  17 under all applicable rules.  18 BY MS. SAMUELS:  19 Q. Have you ever given a deposition  20 before, sir?  21 A. Yes.  22 Q. And about how many times?  23 A. Six or seven.		ROUGH A. Daluk.			£
Mr. Drew Wycoff  Mr. Ethan Fox  15 Case No. 20 CV 7209. This deposition is taken pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties under all applicable rules.  18 BY MS. SAMUELS:  19 Q. Have you ever given a deposition before, sir?  21 A. Yes.  22 Q. And about how many times?  23 A. Six or seven.		Also prosent		*	1
16 Mr. Ethan Fox 16 pursuant to notice and agreement of the parties 17 under all applicable rules. 18 BY MS. SAMUELS: 19 Q. Have you ever given a deposition 20 20 before, sir? 21 A. Yes. 22 Q. And about how many times? 23 A. Six or seven.				•	
17       under all applicable rules.         18       18       BY MS. SAMUELS:         19       Q. Have you ever given a deposition         20       before, sir?         21       A. Yes.         22       Q. And about how many times?         23       A. Six or seven.					
18       BY MS. SAMUELS:         19       Q. Have you ever given a deposition         20       before, sir?         21       A. Yes.         22       Q. And about how many times?         23       A. Six or seven.		MI. EINAN FOX			
19       Q. Have you ever given a deposition         20       before, sir?         21       21         22       Q. And about how many times?         23       A. Six or seven.				**	
20 before, sir? 21 21 A. Yes. 22 Q. And about how many times? 23 A. Six or seven.					
21 21 A. Yes. 22 Q. And about how many times? 23 A. Six or seven.					
22 Q. And about how many times? 23 A. Six or seven.			20	before, sir?	
23 A. Six or seven.			21	A. Yes.	
23 A. Six or seven.			22	Q. And about how many times?	
			23	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
	24		24	Q. All right.	
				· · ·	

2 (Pages 2 to 5)

6	8
1 A. I believe. Possibly.	1 Q. All right. After high school what did
2 MS. SAMUELS: And I'm sorry. Before	2 you do?
3 we get started, can we get everybody on the	3 A. Went to college.
4 record who's present.	4 Q. What college?
5 MR. MILLER: Yes. So on behalf of	5 A. Rosary College in River Forest.
6 Officer Bartik, it is Graham Miller and Misha	6 Q. How long did you go to college in
7 Itchhaporia. We have Drew Wycoff on there and,	7 River Forest?
8 we also have who's a clerk of ours and we	8 A. I graduated Rosary College in 1987.
9 have another clerk Ethan Fox, who is in the room	9 Q. And what did you graduate with?
10 with us.	10 A. Bachelor's of liberal arts.
11 MS. SAMUELS: All right.	Q. Any specialization or concentration?
12 MS. ADEEYO: Natalie Adeeyo, Breana	12 A. Political science.
Bill, and Neha Locke on behalf of the Defendant,	Q. During the time that you were
14 City of Chicago.	14 attending Rosary, did you have any jobs?
15 MS. SAMUELS: All right. Thank you.	15 A. I worked for I believe I worked for
16 BY MS. SAMUELS:	16 a painting company for about a year.
17 Q. All right.	Q. Okay. Were you ever subject to any
18 And when was the last time	18 discipline while you worked for that painting
19 you've given a deposition, sir?	19 company?
20 A. Sometime within the last year.	20 <b>A. No.</b>
Q. All right. Since it's been fairly	Q. Were you ever subject to any
recently, I won't belabor you with the rules.	22 allegations of misconduct while studying at
23 Just all your answers have to be verbal. If	23 Rosary?
24 it's unclear, let me know. If you want to take	24 <b>A. No.</b>
7 1 break, also let me know. Okay?	9 1 Q. After graduating with your bachelor's
2 A. Yes, ma'am.	2 in liberal arts, what did you do after that?
3 Q. All right. And then, also, if you're	3 A. I then attended John Reid and
4 answering my question, I'll assume you	4 Associates School of Polygraph, Chicago,
5 understood the question and your answer is	5 Illinois.
6 responsive to the question that's being asked.	6 Q. How did you learn about the School of
7 Okay?	7 Polygraph?
8 A. Okay.	8 A. I'm sorry. I didn't hear the
9 Q. What's your current job?	9 question, ma'am.
10 A. I have none.	Q. How did you learn about the School of
Q. All right. When's the last time you	11 Polygraph?
12 were employed?	12 A. Did I what?
13 A. December 15th, 2019.	Q. How did you learn about the school?
Q. From December 15th, 2019, until today,	14 A. Oh, through my family.
15 have you had any employment?	Q. Do you have other members of your
16 <b>A. No.</b>	family who have gone to that school?
17 Q. What year did you graduate high	17 <b>A. Yes.</b>
18 school?	18 Q. All right. Who?
19 A. I'm sorry?	19 A. My sister.
Q. What year did you graduate high	20 Q. Anyone else?
21 school?	21 A. My brother-in-law.
A. I graduated high school in 1982.	Q. Anyone else?
Q. All right. What high school?	23 <b>A. No.</b>
24 A. Fenwick High School in Oak Park.	Q. Okay. What's your sister's name?

	10		12
1	A. There is Roberta Bartik and Denise	1	Q. I'm sorry, what was that?
2	Frances.	2	A. Both.
3	Q. Which one went to the polygraph	3	Q. Both. Okay.
4	school?	4	What's the difference between
5	A. Both of them.	5	human anatomy and physiology?
6	Q. And what's the name of your	6	A. It's been a long time, ma'am. I
7	brother-in-law?	7	couldn't really differentiate right now. It's
8	A. Richard Yinjieski (phonetic).	8	been over thirty some odd years, forty I think.
9	Q. Can you spell the last name for me?	9	Q. All right.
10	A. Not really. It's a Polish name. Not	10	Is there anything that you
11	really.	11	learned during your coursework at John Reid and
12	Q. Okay.	12	Associates about polygraphs or becoming a
13	A. You can sound it out.	13	polygraph operator that has since been that
14	Q. And had both of your sisters gone to	14	has since gone out of use?
15	the polygraph school before you went?	15	MR. MILLER: Object to the form of the
16	A. Yes.	16	question.
17	Q. Okay. At the time that you went to	17	THE WITNESS: I don't believe so.
18	the polygraph school, were your sisters employed	18	MS. SAMUELS: All right.
19	as polygraph technicians?	19	BY MS. SAMUELS:
20	A. I believe my I believe my one	20	Q. Is there anything that you've learned
21	sister was, yes.	21	during your coursework at John Reid and
22	Q. Okay. The sister that you believe	22	Associates about polygraph or becoming a
23	A. Denise.	23	polygraph operator that has since become
24	Q. Okay. And where was she employed as a	24	disfavored or debunked?
1	polygraph technician?	1	MR. MILLER: Same objection.
2	polygraph technician?  A. She was employed for a company, Barts	2	MR. MILLER: Same objection. THE REPORTER: I'm sorry. I can't
2	polygraph technician?  A. She was employed for a company, Barts and Associates.	2 3	MR. MILLER: Same objection. THE REPORTER: I'm sorry. I can't tell who's making the objection from the video.
2 3 4	polygraph technician?  A. She was employed for a company, Barts and Associates.  Q. And do you know what Barts and	2 3 4	MR. MILLER: Same objection. THE REPORTER: I'm sorry. I can't tell who's making the objection from the video. MR. MILLER: It's Graham Miller.
2 3 4 5	polygraph technician?  A. She was employed for a company, Barts and Associates.  Q. And do you know what Barts and Associates does?	2 3 4 5	MR. MILLER: Same objection. THE REPORTER: I'm sorry. I can't tell who's making the objection from the video. MR. MILLER: It's Graham Miller. THE REPORTER: Okay. Thank you.
2 3 4 5 6	polygraph technician?  A. She was employed for a company, Barts and Associates.  Q. And do you know what Barts and Associates does?  A. They were a polygraph and detective	2 3 4 5 6	MR. MILLER: Same objection. THE REPORTER: I'm sorry. I can't tell who's making the objection from the video. MR. MILLER: It's Graham Miller. THE REPORTER: Okay. Thank you. THE WITNESS: Can you repeat the
2 3 4 5 6 7	polygraph technician?  A. She was employed for a company, Barts and Associates.  Q. And do you know what Barts and Associates does?  A. They were a polygraph and detective agency.	2 3 4 5 6 7	MR. MILLER: Same objection.  THE REPORTER: I'm sorry. I can't tell who's making the objection from the video.  MR. MILLER: It's Graham Miller.  THE REPORTER: Okay. Thank you.  THE WITNESS: Can you repeat the question, ma'am?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	polygraph technician?  A. She was employed for a company, Barts and Associates.  Q. And do you know what Barts and Associates does?  A. They were a polygraph and detective agency.  Q. In the Chicago area?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	MR. MILLER: Same objection.  THE REPORTER: I'm sorry. I can't tell who's making the objection from the video.  MR. MILLER: It's Graham Miller.  THE REPORTER: Okay. Thank you.  THE WITNESS: Can you repeat the question, ma'am?  BY MS. SAMUELS:
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	polygraph technician?  A. She was employed for a company, Barts and Associates.  Q. And do you know what Barts and Associates does?  A. They were a polygraph and detective agency.  Q. In the Chicago area?  A. Yes.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	MR. MILLER: Same objection.  THE REPORTER: I'm sorry. I can't tell who's making the objection from the video.  MR. MILLER: It's Graham Miller.  THE REPORTER: Okay. Thank you.  THE WITNESS: Can you repeat the question, ma'am?  BY MS. SAMUELS:  Q. Yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	polygraph technician?  A. She was employed for a company, Barts and Associates.  Q. And do you know what Barts and Associates does?  A. They were a polygraph and detective agency.  Q. In the Chicago area?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And the year that you first	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	MR. MILLER: Same objection. THE REPORTER: I'm sorry. I can't tell who's making the objection from the video. MR. MILLER: It's Graham Miller. THE REPORTER: Okay. Thank you. THE WITNESS: Can you repeat the question, ma'am? BY MS. SAMUELS: Q. Yes. Is there anything that you
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	polygraph technician?  A. She was employed for a company, Barts and Associates.  Q. And do you know what Barts and Associates does?  A. They were a polygraph and detective agency.  Q. In the Chicago area?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And the year that you first attended John Reid and Associates, was that '87?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	MR. MILLER: Same objection. THE REPORTER: I'm sorry. I can't tell who's making the objection from the video. MR. MILLER: It's Graham Miller. THE REPORTER: Okay. Thank you. THE WITNESS: Can you repeat the question, ma'am? BY MS. SAMUELS: Q. Yes. Is there anything that you learned during your coursework at John Reid and
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	polygraph technician?  A. She was employed for a company, Barts and Associates.  Q. And do you know what Barts and Associates does?  A. They were a polygraph and detective agency.  Q. In the Chicago area?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And the year that you first attended John Reid and Associates, was that '87?  A. I believe so. Yes.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	MR. MILLER: Same objection. THE REPORTER: I'm sorry. I can't tell who's making the objection from the video. MR. MILLER: It's Graham Miller. THE REPORTER: Okay. Thank you. THE WITNESS: Can you repeat the question, ma'am? BY MS. SAMUELS: Q. Yes. Is there anything that you learned during your coursework at John Reid and Associates about polygraphs or being a polygraph
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	polygraph technician?  A. She was employed for a company, Barts and Associates.  Q. And do you know what Barts and Associates does?  A. They were a polygraph and detective agency.  Q. In the Chicago area?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And the year that you first attended John Reid and Associates, was that '87?  A. I believe so. Yes.  Q. And how long did you attend John Reid	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	MR. MILLER: Same objection. THE REPORTER: I'm sorry. I can't tell who's making the objection from the video. MR. MILLER: It's Graham Miller. THE REPORTER: Okay. Thank you. THE WITNESS: Can you repeat the question, ma'am? BY MS. SAMUELS: Q. Yes. Is there anything that you learned during your coursework at John Reid and Associates about polygraphs or being a polygraph operator that has since become disfavored or has
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	polygraph technician?  A. She was employed for a company, Barts and Associates.  Q. And do you know what Barts and Associates does?  A. They were a polygraph and detective agency.  Q. In the Chicago area?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And the year that you first attended John Reid and Associates, was that '87?  A. I believe so. Yes.  Q. And how long did you attend John Reid and Associates?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	MR. MILLER: Same objection. THE REPORTER: I'm sorry. I can't tell who's making the objection from the video. MR. MILLER: It's Graham Miller. THE REPORTER: Okay. Thank you. THE WITNESS: Can you repeat the question, ma'am? BY MS. SAMUELS: Q. Yes. Is there anything that you learned during your coursework at John Reid and Associates about polygraphs or being a polygraph operator that has since become disfavored or has been debunked?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	polygraph technician?  A. She was employed for a company, Barts and Associates.  Q. And do you know what Barts and Associates does?  A. They were a polygraph and detective agency.  Q. In the Chicago area?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And the year that you first attended John Reid and Associates, was that '87?  A. I believe so. Yes.  Q. And how long did you attend John Reid and Associates?  A. The curriculum is a six-month course.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	MR. MILLER: Same objection. THE REPORTER: I'm sorry. I can't tell who's making the objection from the video. MR. MILLER: It's Graham Miller. THE REPORTER: Okay. Thank you. THE WITNESS: Can you repeat the question, ma'am? BY MS. SAMUELS: Q. Yes. Is there anything that you learned during your coursework at John Reid and Associates about polygraphs or being a polygraph operator that has since become disfavored or has been debunked? MR. MILLER: Object to form and
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	polygraph technician?  A. She was employed for a company, Barts and Associates.  Q. And do you know what Barts and Associates does?  A. They were a polygraph and detective agency.  Q. In the Chicago area?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And the year that you first attended John Reid and Associates, was that '87?  A. I believe so. Yes.  Q. And how long did you attend John Reid and Associates?  A. The curriculum is a six-month course.  Q. And do you recall what the curriculum	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	MR. MILLER: Same objection.  THE REPORTER: I'm sorry. I can't tell who's making the objection from the video.  MR. MILLER: It's Graham Miller.  THE REPORTER: Okay. Thank you.  THE WITNESS: Can you repeat the question, ma'am?  BY MS. SAMUELS:  Q. Yes.  Is there anything that you learned during your coursework at John Reid and Associates about polygraphs or being a polygraph operator that has since become disfavored or has been debunked?  MR. MILLER: Object to form and foundation.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	polygraph technician?  A. She was employed for a company, Barts and Associates.  Q. And do you know what Barts and Associates does?  A. They were a polygraph and detective agency.  Q. In the Chicago area?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And the year that you first attended John Reid and Associates, was that '87?  A. I believe so. Yes.  Q. And how long did you attend John Reid and Associates?  A. The curriculum is a six-month course.  Q. And do you recall what the curriculum covered?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	MR. MILLER: Same objection. THE REPORTER: I'm sorry. I can't tell who's making the objection from the video. MR. MILLER: It's Graham Miller. THE REPORTER: Okay. Thank you. THE WITNESS: Can you repeat the question, ma'am? BY MS. SAMUELS: Q. Yes. Is there anything that you learned during your coursework at John Reid and Associates about polygraphs or being a polygraph operator that has since become disfavored or has been debunked? MR. MILLER: Object to form and foundation. THE WITNESS: To my knowledge, no.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	polygraph technician?  A. She was employed for a company, Barts and Associates.  Q. And do you know what Barts and Associates does?  A. They were a polygraph and detective agency.  Q. In the Chicago area?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And the year that you first attended John Reid and Associates, was that '87?  A. I believe so. Yes.  Q. And how long did you attend John Reid and Associates?  A. The curriculum is a six-month course.  Q. And do you recall what the curriculum covered?  A. Chart interpretation, human	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	MR. MILLER: Same objection. THE REPORTER: I'm sorry. I can't tell who's making the objection from the video. MR. MILLER: It's Graham Miller. THE REPORTER: Okay. Thank you. THE WITNESS: Can you repeat the question, ma'am? BY MS. SAMUELS: Q. Yes. Is there anything that you learned during your coursework at John Reid and Associates about polygraphs or being a polygraph operator that has since become disfavored or has been debunked? MR. MILLER: Object to form and foundation. THE WITNESS: To my knowledge, no. BY MS. SAMUELS:
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. She was employed for a company, Barts and Associates.  Q. And do you know what Barts and Associates does?  A. They were a polygraph and detective agency.  Q. In the Chicago area?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And the year that you first attended John Reid and Associates, was that '87?  A. I believe so. Yes.  Q. And how long did you attend John Reid and Associates?  A. The curriculum is a six-month course.  Q. And do you recall what the curriculum covered?  A. Chart interpretation, human physiology, anatomy, question formulation,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	MR. MILLER: Same objection. THE REPORTER: I'm sorry. I can't tell who's making the objection from the video. MR. MILLER: It's Graham Miller. THE REPORTER: Okay. Thank you. THE WITNESS: Can you repeat the question, ma'am? BY MS. SAMUELS: Q. Yes. Is there anything that you learned during your coursework at John Reid and Associates about polygraphs or being a polygraph operator that has since become disfavored or has been debunked? MR. MILLER: Object to form and foundation. THE WITNESS: To my knowledge, no. BY MS. SAMUELS: Q. All right. And so is it fair to say
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. She was employed for a company, Barts and Associates.  Q. And do you know what Barts and Associates does?  A. They were a polygraph and detective agency.  Q. In the Chicago area?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And the year that you first attended John Reid and Associates, was that '87?  A. I believe so. Yes.  Q. And how long did you attend John Reid and Associates?  A. The curriculum is a six-month course.  Q. And do you recall what the curriculum covered?  A. Chart interpretation, human physiology, anatomy, question formulation, actual charts history of polygraphs, the general	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	MR. MILLER: Same objection. THE REPORTER: I'm sorry. I can't tell who's making the objection from the video. MR. MILLER: It's Graham Miller. THE REPORTER: Okay. Thank you. THE WITNESS: Can you repeat the question, ma'am? BY MS. SAMUELS: Q. Yes. Is there anything that you learned during your coursework at John Reid and Associates about polygraphs or being a polygraph operator that has since become disfavored or has been debunked? MR. MILLER: Object to form and foundation. THE WITNESS: To my knowledge, no. BY MS. SAMUELS: Q. All right. And so is it fair to say that the curriculum and the coursework that you
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	A. She was employed for a company, Barts and Associates.  Q. And do you know what Barts and Associates does?  A. They were a polygraph and detective agency.  Q. In the Chicago area?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And the year that you first attended John Reid and Associates, was that '87?  A. I believe so. Yes.  Q. And how long did you attend John Reid and Associates?  A. The curriculum is a six-month course.  Q. And do you recall what the curriculum covered?  A. Chart interpretation, human physiology, anatomy, question formulation,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	MR. MILLER: Same objection. THE REPORTER: I'm sorry. I can't tell who's making the objection from the video. MR. MILLER: It's Graham Miller. THE REPORTER: Okay. Thank you. THE WITNESS: Can you repeat the question, ma'am? BY MS. SAMUELS: Q. Yes. Is there anything that you learned during your coursework at John Reid and Associates about polygraphs or being a polygraph operator that has since become disfavored or has been debunked? MR. MILLER: Object to form and foundation. THE WITNESS: To my knowledge, no. BY MS. SAMUELS: Q. All right. And so is it fair to say that the curriculum and the coursework that you learned at John Reid and Associates, to your
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	polygraph technician?  A. She was employed for a company, Barts and Associates.  Q. And do you know what Barts and Associates does?  A. They were a polygraph and detective agency.  Q. In the Chicago area?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And the year that you first attended John Reid and Associates, was that '87?  A. I believe so. Yes.  Q. And how long did you attend John Reid and Associates?  A. The curriculum is a six-month course.  Q. And do you recall what the curriculum covered?  A. Chart interpretation, human physiology, anatomy, question formulation, actual charts history of polygraphs, the general makeup of the polygraph instrument at the time.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	MR. MILLER: Same objection. THE REPORTER: I'm sorry. I can't tell who's making the objection from the video. MR. MILLER: It's Graham Miller. THE REPORTER: Okay. Thank you. THE WITNESS: Can you repeat the question, ma'am? BY MS. SAMUELS: Q. Yes. Is there anything that you learned during your coursework at John Reid and Associates about polygraphs or being a polygraph operator that has since become disfavored or has been debunked? MR. MILLER: Object to form and foundation. THE WITNESS: To my knowledge, no. BY MS. SAMUELS: Q. All right. And so is it fair to say that the curriculum and the coursework that you
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	polygraph technician?  A. She was employed for a company, Barts and Associates.  Q. And do you know what Barts and Associates does?  A. They were a polygraph and detective agency.  Q. In the Chicago area?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And the year that you first attended John Reid and Associates, was that '87?  A. I believe so. Yes.  Q. And how long did you attend John Reid and Associates?  A. The curriculum is a six-month course.  Q. And do you recall what the curriculum covered?  A. Chart interpretation, human physiology, anatomy, question formulation, actual charts history of polygraphs, the general makeup of the polygraph instrument at the time.  Q. I'm sorry. Did you say human anatomy	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	MR. MILLER: Same objection. THE REPORTER: I'm sorry. I can't tell who's making the objection from the video. MR. MILLER: It's Graham Miller. THE REPORTER: Okay. Thank you. THE WITNESS: Can you repeat the question, ma'am? BY MS. SAMUELS: Q. Yes. Is there anything that you learned during your coursework at John Reid and Associates about polygraphs or being a polygraph operator that has since become disfavored or has been debunked? MR. MILLER: Object to form and foundation. THE WITNESS: To my knowledge, no. BY MS. SAMUELS: Q. All right. And so is it fair to say that the curriculum and the coursework that you learned at John Reid and Associates, to your knowledge, is still current and applicable for

	14		16
1	Q. Okay.	1	other things?
2	How this is going to be an	2	A. Galvanic skin response.
3	incredibly vague question, but how do you read a	3	Q. Would you spell that, please?
4	polygraph?	4	A. G-a-l-v-a-n-i-c s-k-i-n response.
5	MR. MILLER: Object to the form.	5	Q. Okay. And heart rate is basically the
6	THE WITNESS: You get trained to do	6	beats per minute for your heart, correct?
7	SO.	7	A. Yes.
8	BY MS. SAMUELS:	8	Q. All right. Blood pressure, I'm
9	Q. Right. And so I understand that,	9	thinking of, like, the normal blood pressure
10	like well, let me pull one up and see if that	10	reading you would take from a blood pressure
11	helps. Give me one second. If I can find it	11	cuff or something like that?
12	there we go.	12	A. The instrument we use to measure is a
13	So I'm going to show you	13	blood pressure cuff.
14	I'm going to share screen on a polygraph. Can	14	Q. Okay. How do you measure respiratory
15	you see this?	15	rate?
16	A. Yes.	16	
			A. We attach two instruments. They're
17	Q. Okay. And it's fair to say you're	17	called pneumograph tubes around the subject.
18	trained to read and interpret what this means?	18	Q. Okay. And what does a pneumograph
19	A. Yes.	19	tube tell you?
20	MR. MILLER: Can you zoom in or	20	A. They measure breathing.
21	whatever.	21	Q. Okay. Is that just how much you're
22	BY MS. SAMUELS:	22	inhaling and exhaling in a given minute or
23	Q. Do you need me to zoom in more or can	23	something like that?
24	you see it okay?	24	A. It measures your breathing.
	15		17
1	A. That's fine.	1	Q. Okay. And galvanic skin response,
2	Q. Hold on.	2	what is that?
3	And so my first question is,	3	A. The galvanic skin response are two
4	this sheet that I'm looking at, which has been	4	small pedals that are attached to the most
5	Bates marked City NK 1535, what would you call	5	likely the fore the forefinger and ring
6	this chart?	6	finger, and it measures the it measures the
7	A. Those are the that is that is	7	activity of the atrichial sweat glands.
8	half of an examination. That's half of a	8	Q. And what are the atrichial sweat
9	physiological recording of a subject that was	9	glands?
10	administered a polygraph examination.	10	A. On your fingers.
11	Q. Okay. And when you are administering	11	Q. Okay. And so the galvanic skin
12	a polygraph examination, are there what	12	response, is that a measurement of just like how
13	are there is there more than one thing that	13	much it's for to what extent somebody is
14	you're measuring?	14	sweating?
15	A. Yes.	15	A. It could be, yes.
16	Q. Okay. What are the things that you're	16	Q. Okay. Is there a standard rate or is
17	measuring during a polygraph examination?	17	there a standard number that you would well,
18	A. Heart rate, blood pressure, breathing,	18	let me first ask this.
19	respiratory rate, breath suppressions, galvanic	19	What can a polygraph
20	skin response.	20	examination determine?
21	Q. I'm sorry. So heart rate, blood	21	MR. MILLER: Object to the form of the
22	pressure, respiratory rate. Is that correct?	22	question.
23	A. Yes.	23	THE WITNESS: A polygraph examination
24	Q. All right. I'm sorry. What were the	24	measures physiological responses to specific

	18		20
1	questions to determine physiological whether	1	pen, you make sure that the cuff is working and
2	or not that person is physiologically reacting	2	what pressure the cuff needs to be before you
3	to those specific questions asked.	3	actually start the actual examination.
4	BY MS. SAMUELS:	4	Q. Okay. And during this time are you
5	Q. Okay. And when you're examining the	5	asking questions?
6	physiological responses, do you make certain	6	A. No.
7	conclusions based upon those responses?	7	Q. Okay. And so this is essentially just
8	A. Yes.	8	calibrating the machine or the different devices
9	Q. What determinations would you make?	9	to the individual?
10	MR. MILLER: Object to the form of the	10	A. I wouldn't say calibrating. You're
11	question.	11	just making sure that the machine is getting the
12	THE WITNESS: It could be	12	proper recordings.
13	inconclusive, deceptive, or non-deceptive.	13	Q. All right. And how can you I
14	BY MS. SAMUELS:	14	guess, what are you looking for to make sure
15	Q. All right.	15	that the machine is getting the proper
16	Are there objective	16	recordings?
17	indications for these determinations or do these	17	A. All proper amplitudes so that you are
18	determinations depend on each individual?	18	not getting straight lines. You're getting
19	A. Can you repeat the question, Counsel?	19	enough to where the where you can see the
20	I don't understand the question.	20	responses.
21	Q. Sure. So let me try to give you so	21	Q. And what about the document that you
22	I guess what I'm asking is, like, so .08 is the	22	are viewing now let's you know that this is the
23	blood alcohol limit, right, regardless of who an	23	test page?
24	individual is, right?	24	A. That the blood pressure cuff was only
	19		21
1	19 And so I guess what I'm	1	
1 2		1 2	on the subject for forty-seven seconds, that there were no questions asked of the individual
	And so I guess what I'm getting is, would you expect to see a certain number in every individual where you say if they		on the subject for forty-seven seconds, that
2	And so I guess what I'm getting is, would you expect to see a certain number in every individual where you say if they meet that number then this means something, or	2	on the subject for forty-seven seconds, that there were no questions asked of the individual during that forty-seven seconds, and I believe there is a there's a mark, a notation, that
2	And so I guess what I'm getting is, would you expect to see a certain number in every individual where you say if they meet that number then this means something, or are you saying depending on each or does each	2	on the subject for forty-seven seconds, that there were no questions asked of the individual during that forty-seven seconds, and I believe there is a — there's a mark, a notation, that circle that says "TC," test chart.
2 3 4 5 6	And so I guess what I'm getting is, would you expect to see a certain number in every individual where you say if they meet that number then this means something, or are you saying depending on each or does each subject have their own baseline?	2 3 4 5 6	on the subject for forty-seven seconds, that there were no questions asked of the individual during that forty-seven seconds, and I believe there is a there's a mark, a notation, that circle that says "TC," test chart.  Q. Okay. Is this where is the TC?
2 3 4 5 6 7	And so I guess what I'm getting is, would you expect to see a certain number in every individual where you say if they meet that number then this means something, or are you saying depending on each or does each subject have their own baseline?  A. Each subject has their own baseline.	2 3 4 5 6 7	on the subject for forty-seven seconds, that there were no questions asked of the individual during that forty-seven seconds, and I believe there is a — there's a mark, a notation, that circle that says "TC," test chart.  Q. Okay. Is this — where is the TC? Where do you see it says "TC?"
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	And so I guess what I'm getting is, would you expect to see a certain number in every individual where you say if they meet that number then this means something, or are you saying depending on each or does each subject have their own baseline?  A. Each subject has their own baseline.  Q. Okay. And then based upon that	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	on the subject for forty-seven seconds, that there were no questions asked of the individual during that forty-seven seconds, and I believe there is a there's a mark, a notation, that circle that says "TC," test chart.  Q. Okay. Is this where is the TC? Where do you see it says "TC?"  A. On the bottom of the page, there's two
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	And so I guess what I'm getting is, would you expect to see a certain number in every individual where you say if they meet that number then this means something, or are you saying depending on each or does each subject have their own baseline?  A. Each subject has their own baseline.  Q. Okay. And then based upon that subject, you determine whether their responses	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	on the subject for forty-seven seconds, that there were no questions asked of the individual during that forty-seven seconds, and I believe there is a — there's a mark, a notation, that circle that says "TC," test chart.  Q. Okay. Is this — where is the TC? Where do you see it says "TC?"  A. On the bottom of the page, there's two circled — there's two circled — there's —
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	And so I guess what I'm getting is, would you expect to see a certain number in every individual where you say if they meet that number then this means something, or are you saying depending on each or does each subject have their own baseline?  A. Each subject has their own baseline.  Q. Okay. And then based upon that subject, you determine whether their responses tend to indicate whether it's inconclusive,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	on the subject for forty-seven seconds, that there were no questions asked of the individual during that forty-seven seconds, and I believe there is a — there's a mark, a notation, that circle that says "TC," test chart.  Q. Okay. Is this — where is the TC? Where do you see it says "TC?"  A. On the bottom of the page, there's two circled — there's two circled — there's — there is a number — there's almost like a
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	And so I guess what I'm getting is, would you expect to see a certain number in every individual where you say if they meet that number then this means something, or are you saying depending on each or does each subject have their own baseline?  A. Each subject has their own baseline.  Q. Okay. And then based upon that subject, you determine whether their responses tend to indicate whether it's inconclusive, deceptive, or non-deceptive?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	on the subject for forty-seven seconds, that there were no questions asked of the individual during that forty-seven seconds, and I believe there is a there's a mark, a notation, that circle that says "TC," test chart.  Q. Okay. Is this where is the TC? Where do you see it says "TC?"  A. On the bottom of the page, there's two circled there's there is a number there's almost like a fraction and then over to the left is the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	And so I guess what I'm getting is, would you expect to see a certain number in every individual where you say if they meet that number then this means something, or are you saying depending on each or does each subject have their own baseline?  A. Each subject has their own baseline.  Q. Okay. And then based upon that subject, you determine whether their responses tend to indicate whether it's inconclusive, deceptive, or non-deceptive?  A. Yes.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	on the subject for forty-seven seconds, that there were no questions asked of the individual during that forty-seven seconds, and I believe there is a there's a mark, a notation, that circle that says "TC," test chart.  Q. Okay. Is this where is the TC? Where do you see it says "TC?"  A. On the bottom of the page, there's two circled there's there is a number there's almost like a fraction and then over to the left is the circle, and directly above it that's says "TC."
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	And so I guess what I'm getting is, would you expect to see a certain number in every individual where you say if they meet that number then this means something, or are you saying depending on each or does each subject have their own baseline?  A. Each subject has their own baseline.  Q. Okay. And then based upon that subject, you determine whether their responses tend to indicate whether it's inconclusive, deceptive, or non-deceptive?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. Flipping to what's been marked	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	on the subject for forty-seven seconds, that there were no questions asked of the individual during that forty-seven seconds, and I believe there is a there's a mark, a notation, that circle that says "TC," test chart.  Q. Okay. Is this where is the TC? Where do you see it says "TC?"  A. On the bottom of the page, there's two circled there's two circled there's salmost like a fraction and then over to the left is the circle, and directly above it that's says "TC."  Q. Got you. All right. And then the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	And so I guess what I'm getting is, would you expect to see a certain number in every individual where you say if they meet that number then this means something, or are you saying depending on each or does each subject have their own baseline?  A. Each subject has their own baseline.  Q. Okay. And then based upon that subject, you determine whether their responses tend to indicate whether it's inconclusive, deceptive, or non-deceptive?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. Flipping to what's been marked as FC I'm sorry, City NK 1529. Can you still	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	on the subject for forty-seven seconds, that there were no questions asked of the individual during that forty-seven seconds, and I believe there is a there's a mark, a notation, that circle that says "TC," test chart.  Q. Okay. Is this where is the TC? Where do you see it says "TC?"  A. On the bottom of the page, there's two circled there's two circled there's there is a number there's almost like a fraction and then over to the left is the circle, and directly above it that's says "TC."  Q. Got you. All right. And then the circle that's below it, do you know what that
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	And so I guess what I'm getting is, would you expect to see a certain number in every individual where you say if they meet that number then this means something, or are you saying depending on each or does each subject have their own baseline?  A. Each subject has their own baseline.  Q. Okay. And then based upon that subject, you determine whether their responses tend to indicate whether it's inconclusive, deceptive, or non-deceptive?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. Flipping to what's been marked as FC I'm sorry, City NK 1529. Can you still see this?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	on the subject for forty-seven seconds, that there were no questions asked of the individual during that forty-seven seconds, and I believe there is a there's a mark, a notation, that circle that says "TC," test chart.  Q. Okay. Is this where is the TC? Where do you see it says "TC?"  A. On the bottom of the page, there's two circled there's two circled there's there is a number there's almost like a fraction and then over to the left is the circle, and directly above it that's says "TC."  Q. Got you. All right. And then the circle that's below it, do you know what that means or what that would indicate?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	And so I guess what I'm getting is, would you expect to see a certain number in every individual where you say if they meet that number then this means something, or are you saying depending on each or does each subject have their own baseline?  A. Each subject has their own baseline.  Q. Okay. And then based upon that subject, you determine whether their responses tend to indicate whether it's inconclusive, deceptive, or non-deceptive?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. Flipping to what's been marked as FC I'm sorry, City NK 1529. Can you still see this?  A. Yes.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	on the subject for forty-seven seconds, that there were no questions asked of the individual during that forty-seven seconds, and I believe there is a there's a mark, a notation, that circle that says "TC," test chart.  Q. Okay. Is this where is the TC? Where do you see it says "TC?"  A. On the bottom of the page, there's two circled there's two circled there's there is a number there's almost like a fraction and then over to the left is the circle, and directly above it that's says "TC."  Q. Got you. All right. And then the circle that's below it, do you know what that means or what that would indicate?  A. That would indicate the amount of
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	And so I guess what I'm getting is, would you expect to see a certain number in every individual where you say if they meet that number then this means something, or are you saying depending on each or does each subject have their own baseline?  A. Each subject has their own baseline.  Q. Okay. And then based upon that subject, you determine whether their responses tend to indicate whether it's inconclusive, deceptive, or non-deceptive?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. Flipping to what's been marked as FC I'm sorry, City NK 1529. Can you still see this?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. Can you tell if this is the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	on the subject for forty-seven seconds, that there were no questions asked of the individual during that forty-seven seconds, and I believe there is a there's a mark, a notation, that circle that says "TC," test chart.  Q. Okay. Is this where is the TC? Where do you see it says "TC?"  A. On the bottom of the page, there's two circled there's two circled there's there is a number there's almost like a fraction and then over to the left is the circle, and directly above it that's says "TC."  Q. Got you. All right. And then the circle that's below it, do you know what that means or what that would indicate?  A. That would indicate the amount of sensitivity that the examiner had brought in to
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	And so I guess what I'm getting is, would you expect to see a certain number in every individual where you say if they meet that number then this means something, or are you saying depending on each or does each subject have their own baseline?  A. Each subject has their own baseline.  Q. Okay. And then based upon that subject, you determine whether their responses tend to indicate whether it's inconclusive, deceptive, or non-deceptive?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. Flipping to what's been marked as FC I'm sorry, City NK 1529. Can you still see this?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. Can you tell if this is the beginning of a chart?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	on the subject for forty-seven seconds, that there were no questions asked of the individual during that forty-seven seconds, and I believe there is a there's a mark, a notation, that circle that says "TC," test chart.  Q. Okay. Is this where is the TC? Where do you see it says "TC?"  A. On the bottom of the page, there's two circled there's two circled there's there is a number there's almost like a fraction and then over to the left is the circle, and directly above it that's says "TC."  Q. Got you. All right. And then the circle that's below it, do you know what that means or what that would indicate?  A. That would indicate the amount of sensitivity that the examiner had brought in to the response to make sure that he could see
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	And so I guess what I'm getting is, would you expect to see a certain number in every individual where you say if they meet that number then this means something, or are you saying depending on each or does each subject have their own baseline?  A. Each subject has their own baseline. Q. Okay. And then based upon that subject, you determine whether their responses tend to indicate whether it's inconclusive, deceptive, or non-deceptive?  A. Yes. Q. Okay. Flipping to what's been marked as FC I'm sorry, City NK 1529. Can you still see this?  A. Yes. Q. Okay. Can you tell if this is the beginning of a chart?  A. I believe that the what I'm looking	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	on the subject for forty-seven seconds, that there were no questions asked of the individual during that forty-seven seconds, and I believe there is a there's a mark, a notation, that circle that says "TC," test chart.  Q. Okay. Is this where is the TC? Where do you see it says "TC?"  A. On the bottom of the page, there's two circled there's two circled there's there is a number there's almost like a fraction and then over to the left is the circle, and directly above it that's says "TC."  Q. Got you. All right. And then the circle that's below it, do you know what that means or what that would indicate?  A. That would indicate the amount of sensitivity that the examiner had brought in to the response to make sure that he could see whatever it was he needed to see.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	And so I guess what I'm getting is, would you expect to see a certain number in every individual where you say if they meet that number then this means something, or are you saying depending on each or does each subject have their own baseline?  A. Each subject has their own baseline.  Q. Okay. And then based upon that subject, you determine whether their responses tend to indicate whether it's inconclusive, deceptive, or non-deceptive?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. Flipping to what's been marked as FC I'm sorry, City NK 1529. Can you still see this?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. Can you tell if this is the beginning of a chart?  A. I believe that the what I'm looking at there is a test chart.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	on the subject for forty-seven seconds, that there were no questions asked of the individual during that forty-seven seconds, and I believe there is a — there's a mark, a notation, that circle that says "TC," test chart.  Q. Okay. Is this — where is the TC? Where do you see it says "TC?"  A. On the bottom of the page, there's two circled — there's two circled — there's two circled — there is a number — there's almost like a fraction and then over to the left is the circle, and directly above it that's says "TC."  Q. Got you. All right. And then the circle that's below it, do you know what that means or what that would indicate?  A. That would indicate the amount of sensitivity that the examiner had brought in to the response to make sure that he could see whatever it was he needed to see.  Q. All right. And to the right, the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	And so I guess what I'm getting is, would you expect to see a certain number in every individual where you say if they meet that number then this means something, or are you saying depending on each or does each subject have their own baseline?  A. Each subject has their own baseline.  Q. Okay. And then based upon that subject, you determine whether their responses tend to indicate whether it's inconclusive, deceptive, or non-deceptive?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. Flipping to what's been marked as FC I'm sorry, City NK 1529. Can you still see this?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. Can you tell if this is the beginning of a chart?  A. I believe that the what I'm looking at there is a test chart.  Q. Okay. And what's a test chart?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	on the subject for forty-seven seconds, that there were no questions asked of the individual during that forty-seven seconds, and I believe there is a — there's a mark, a notation, that circle that says "TC," test chart.  Q. Okay. Is this — where is the TC? Where do you see it says "TC?"  A. On the bottom of the page, there's two circled — there's two circled — there's two circled — there is a number — there's almost like a fraction and then over to the left is the circle, and directly above it that's says "TC."  Q. Got you. All right. And then the circle that's below it, do you know what that means or what that would indicate?  A. That would indicate the amount of sensitivity that the examiner had brought in to the response to make sure that he could see whatever it was he needed to see.  Q. All right. And to the right, the fraction, is that the blood pressure?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	And so I guess what I'm getting is, would you expect to see a certain number in every individual where you say if they meet that number then this means something, or are you saying depending on each or does each subject have their own baseline?  A. Each subject has their own baseline.  Q. Okay. And then based upon that subject, you determine whether their responses tend to indicate whether it's inconclusive, deceptive, or non-deceptive?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. Flipping to what's been marked as FC I'm sorry, City NK 1529. Can you still see this?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. Can you tell if this is the beginning of a chart?  A. I believe that the what I'm looking at there is a test chart.  Q. Okay. And what's a test chart?  A. If you attach the individual to the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	on the subject for forty-seven seconds, that there were no questions asked of the individual during that forty-seven seconds, and I believe there is a — there's a mark, a notation, that circle that says "TC," test chart.  Q. Okay. Is this — where is the TC? Where do you see it says "TC?"  A. On the bottom of the page, there's two circled — there's two circled — there's — there is a number — there's almost like a fraction and then over to the left is the circle, and directly above it that's says "TC."  Q. Got you. All right. And then the circle that's below it, do you know what that means or what that would indicate?  A. That would indicate the amount of sensitivity that the examiner had brought in to the response to make sure that he could see whatever it was he needed to see.  Q. All right. And to the right, the fraction, is that the blood pressure?  A. That is after he placed the blood
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	And so I guess what I'm getting is, would you expect to see a certain number in every individual where you say if they meet that number then this means something, or are you saying depending on each or does each subject have their own baseline?  A. Each subject has their own baseline.  Q. Okay. And then based upon that subject, you determine whether their responses tend to indicate whether it's inconclusive, deceptive, or non-deceptive?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. Flipping to what's been marked as FC I'm sorry, City NK 1529. Can you still see this?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. Can you tell if this is the beginning of a chart?  A. I believe that the what I'm looking at there is a test chart.  Q. Okay. And what's a test chart?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	on the subject for forty-seven seconds, that there were no questions asked of the individual during that forty-seven seconds, and I believe there is a there's a mark, a notation, that circle that says "TC," test chart.  Q. Okay. Is this where is the TC? Where do you see it says "TC?"  A. On the bottom of the page, there's two circled there's two circled there's there is a number there's almost like a fraction and then over to the left is the circle, and directly above it that's says "TC."  Q. Got you. All right. And then the circle that's below it, do you know what that means or what that would indicate?  A. That would indicate the amount of sensitivity that the examiner had brought in to the response to make sure that he could see whatever it was he needed to see.  Q. All right. And to the right, the fraction, is that the blood pressure?

24 1 sort of assess the machine to make sure that 1 it goes through the whole system. And that's the one -- that's the resting number on the 2 2 it's reading an individual's response at the 3 right level or at an accurate level. Is that 3 4 O. Okay. The chart has a number of 4 fair? 5 vertical lines. Do these indicate anything to 5 A. We put the machine to the point where 6 6 we can see the responses, yes. A. Those are -- those are five-second 7 7 Q. Right. 8 8 And so if a machine is intervals. 9 9 Q. Okay. The chart also has a number of calibrated too softly where you can't see --10 horizontal lines. Do those indicate anything to 10 well, let me ask that. Can you miscalibrate a machine so that it's unable to accurately see a 11 you? 11 12 12 A. No. response? 13 13 Q. The chart has a number of -- I guess A. I suppose you could. 14 these would be readings. It looks like this 14 Q. How would that be done? 15 chart has four different readings. Is that 15 A. Well, when you attach the respiratory 16 bands around the -- the breathing or pneumograph 16 17 17 A. Four different readings? tubes could be put on the subject loosely. The 18 Q. Yeah. Four different lines going 18 sensitivity measure could not be put up high 19 across the chart. 19 enough to where you can get a discernable 20 20 A. Those are the four parameters that we reading. You don't inflate the cuff enough to 21 21 where you get a high enough length for the blood 22 22 Q. Okay. And so the most -- the highest pressure and heart beat. 2.3 23 one, what does this measure? Q. What if -- that would result in not 24 A. That's breathing. 24 being able to read or being able to discern the 25 23 1 results because it would be too insensitive. Is 1 Q. Okay. The second one, what does that 2 2 measure? that fair? 3 3 A. It's a possibility. It doesn't A. Also breathing. Q. All right. The third line, what does 4 necessarily mean that it's always. You know, if 4 5 you put the breathing tubes on a little loose, 5 that measure? 6 6 A. The galvanic skin response. you could crank the sensitivity up. Or if an 7 Q. And the fourth line, what does that 7 examiner sees that something happened, they can 8 measure? 8 readjust at any time. 9 Q. Okay. What happens if -- well, is it 9 A. The blood pressure. Q. Where is the respiratory rate? Where 10 possible to put the breathing tubes on too 10 would that be recorded? 11 tight? 11 A. The top two lines. 12 A. I mean, anything's possible, 12 13 13 Q. Okay. Counselor. But, I mean, if they're on too I'm sorry. Where would heart 14 14 tight, usually the person that you're giving the 15 rate be measured? 15 examination to will -- you know, we'll get the 16 16 A. On the bottom. Blood pressure. subject's complaints about it. Then you would 17 Q. Oh. So blood pressure and heart rate 17 adjust it accordingly. 18 are on the same line? 18 Q. How would putting on a breathing tube 19 19 A. Yes. too tight affect the reading? 20 20 Q. Okay. What happens if the machine A. Well, it would be expanding and contracting of the tubes. So if the tube is isn't calibrated enough? How would that affect 21 21 the results of the readings? 22 already expanded, it's not allowed to contract, 22 23 23 A. Calibrated how? then you won't get necessarily the breathing. 24 Q. So my understanding is you have to 24 Q. So would that result in a false --

26 1 So if the tube is attached too 1 would expect an individual to do that, but I'm 2 tightly, if I'm understanding you correctly, 2 more concerned about if there was an error how 3 then it wouldn't be able to measure -- it would 3 we would expect those things to play out. Does 4 result in a lower reading for breathing because 4 that make sense? 5 it couldn't measure it accurately? 5 MR. MILLER: I object to the form of 6 6 A. No. It means that the examiner would the question. Incomplete hypothetical. Calls 7 see it and would have to readjust the attachment 7 for speculation. 8 8 THE WITNESS: It all depends, to make sure that you can get good readings. 9 9 Q. Right. And so I'm talking about if Counselor. 10 it's not readjusted, how would that affect the 10 BY MS. SAMUELS: reading? Would it result in seeing too much 11 11 Q. Okay. 12 breathing or too little breathing? 12 And so if a tube is placed too 13 13 A. Well, I mean, first off, I'm a little loosely, it can result in seeing -- I'm sorry. 14 confused because the question is would a --14 If a pneumograph tube is placed too loosely, it 15 would an examiner put a tight breathing tube 15 can result in seeing too much inhalation or too 16 around the person and not want to measure what 16 little inhalation, it just depends on the 17 needs to be measured. That doesn't make sense 17 individual? 18 to -- you know, if you want the reading, you get 18 A. A lot of it depends on the individual. 19 the reading. If the tube is too tight, you're 19 Q. Okay. And same question. If a 20 not going to see the peaks and valleys of the 20 pneumograph tube is placed too tightly, it can 21 breathing. 21 result in seeing too much breathing or too 22 Q. Right. 22 little breathing, it just depends on the 23 And so if I'm understanding 23 individual? 24 you correctly, having a tube too tight, as well 24 A. It depends. 27 29 1 Q. Okay. And same question for a blood 1 as having a tube too loose, would result in the 2 2 pressure cuff. If a blood pressure is placed same, I guess, error where it's not able to 3 too lightly, would you expect that to result in 3 correctly pick up the breathing. Is that fair? 4 seeing erroneously high or an erroneously low 4 A. It's possible, but that doesn't 5 5 blood pressure? necessarily mean that it's going to be that way 6 6 all the time. A. I would expect the examiner to adjust 7 7 Q. Okay. So would it be fair to say if the tension or the pressure of the polygraph --8 8 someone placed the respiratory -- it's a of the blood pressure cuff to make sure that he 9 9 respiratory tube, correct? has the proper measurement coming off of the --10 10 I mean, on to the instrument. A. Pneumograph. 11 Q. I'm sorry, pneumograph tube. 11 Q. Understood. 12 All right. So if the 12 But assuming that it wasn't 13 pneumograph tube is pressed -- is applied too 13 fixed to fit perfectly, if a blood pressure was 14 tightly or too loosely, you would expect the 14 applied too loose, would you expect that to 15 reading to show -- the reading not to be able to 15 result in an erroneously high or an erroneously 16 show an accurate number or an accurate count for 16 low reading? 17 breathing? 17 A. That all depends. I can't speculate 18 A. No. I believe that if the pneumograph 18 on that, Counselor. 19 19 tube was applied either too loosely or too Q. Okay. Same question. If a blood 20 pressure cuff is placed too tightly, would you tightly that the examiner would get up and he 20 21 expect that to result in an erroneously high or would adjust it on the person that he put it on 21 22 to make sure that it fits properly. 22 an erroneously low reading? 23 23 Q. Sure. A. Once again, I can't speculate on that, 24 And in a perfect world, we 24 Counselor. I don't know.

30 32 1 Q. Okay. And then I think the last thing 1 nervous, right? And so I understand that these 2 you mentioned was the galvanic skin response 2 are things that you can objectively measure, 3 that's clipped to your fingers, correct? 3 right? 4 A. Yes. 4 My question is, when you're 5 Q. Okay. Is it possible to place that 5 examining somebody during the polygraph, is 6 there anything besides those four things you 6 erroneously or incorrectly? 7 MR. MILLER: Object to form but --7 mentioned that you take into consideration? 8 THE WITNESS: I suppose anything is 8 A. In order to determine truth or 9 9 deception, we use those four parameters. possible. 10 BY MS. SAMUELS: 10 Q. Okay. And nothing else, fair? 11 Q. Okay. I guess, how should that be 11 A. That is correct. 12 12 correctly applied? Q. Okay. Thank you, sir. 13 A. I believe I already answered that 13 So after the six months at 14 once. You would attach it to the ring finger 14 John Reid and Associates, did you graduate? 15 and the pointer finger on the tips of the 15 A. Yes. 16 Q. Okay. What did you do after finger, and you wrap -- they're wrapped around 16 17 graduating from John Reid and Associates? on the -- on the pads of the bottom of the 17 18 18 I can stop sharing this. fingers. 19 Q. Okay. Does it have to be the ring 19 A. I became licensed and I -- in November 20 20 finger and the pointer finger? of 1988, I became a Chicago police officer. 21 Q. All right. Was that your date of 21 Q. Okay. And so regardless of what 22 22 appointment? 23 finger it's applied to, you would expect the 23 A. November 7th, 1988. 24 reading to essentially have the same response? 24 Q. Okay. What made you decide to become 31 33 1 A. Yes. a police officer? 1 2 2 Q. Okay. Besides reading the indications A. It was in the family. My father was a 3 as a result to, excuse me, as it relates to 3 police officer and my sister was a police 4 heart rate, blood pressure, respiratory rate, 4 officer. 5 and galvanic skin response, are you looking for 5 Q. Which sister is a police officer? 6 anything else while you're taking a polygraph 6 A. Roberta Bartik. 7 examination? 7 Q. Okay. Was she a polygraph examiner 8 A. Those are the readings that we 8 with CPD as well? 9 9 measure. Those are the parameters that we A. Yes. 10 10 Q. Okay. When you joined the police measure. 11 11 department, did you join to become a polygraph Q. All right. Are there any other 12 parameters that you take into consideration? 12 examiner? 13 A. Those are the parameters that we 13 A. No. Q. Okay. So where was your first area of 14 measure. 14 15 Q. Understood, sir. 15 assignment? 16 My question is, are there any 16 A. I did my first training out of the 17 other factors that you take into consideration? 17 academy in the 19th District. 18 A. When evaluating a polygraph 18 Q. All right. Is that while you're still examination, those are the four parameters that 19 19 on probation? 20 20 A. Yes. we measure. 21 Q. I understand that, sir. So I can 21 Q. Okay. After your probationary period 22 measure something but also take into 22 ended, where did you go? 23 consideration pitch or tone of the individual, 23 A. I was transferred to the 24th 24 whether they're looking away or laughing or seem 24 District.

34 36 1 Q. All right. And how long did you stay 1 Q. Was 11th and State, was that a -- what 2 at the 24th District? 2 building is that? Is that a -- that's not a 3 3 district, is it? A. Approximately, I believe it was around 4 4 A. It was police headquarters. ten vears. 5 Q. All right. When you were first 5 Q. Oh, okay. It's before my time. I'm 6 transferred to the 24th District, was it as a 6 used to it being on 35th. 7 7 patrolman? How did you -- did you have to 8 8 apply to become a member of the polygraph unit? A. Yes. 9 9 Q. Okay. When -- at the time that you A. There was a notice issued 10 left the 24th District, did you -- was this 10 department-wide. I put in my application with 11 still as a patrolman? 11 my resume and I was brought down there. 12 A. Yes. 12 O. Okay. 13 13 Q. Okay. Were you ever assigned to any Prior to joining the polygraph 14 special teams or anything like that while you 14 unit, had you used your training or your 15 were at the 24th District? 15 certification from John Reid and Associates to operate as a polygraph examiner in any other 16 A. No. 16 Q. All right. Did you ever receive any 17 17 capacity? 18 specialized training or any specialized 18 A. Yes. 19 assignments while you were at the 24th District? 19 Q. All right. How or when? A. I was employed by Barts and Associates 20 A. Other than the required roll call 20 21 trainings and trainings that I had to go down to 21 on a part-time basis. 22 the academy, which, you know, would -- on a 22 Q. When was that? 23 normal basis they would have you do. 23 A. From the time that I was licensed 24 Q. All right. 24 through, I believe, 2011. 35 37 So I guess it's, like -- they 1 Q. For your work as a -- I guess, did you 1 2 have, like, general refresher courses that all 2 have an official job title for Barts and police officers are expected to go through. Is 3 3 Associates? 4 that fair? 4 A. Polygraph examiner. 5 5 Q. Okay. While you worked for -- as a A. Yes. 6 polygraph examiner for Barts and Associates, did 6 Q. Okay. And that's what you're 7 referring to but nothing special that no one 7 you ever investigate criminal matters? 8 else was expected to go through. Is that fair? 8 A. Mostly what we -- what I was involved 9 9 with was domestic-type fidelity issues. A. Yes. 10 MR. MILLER: Object to form. 10 Q. Okay. Did you ever have to give a polygraph examination in any criminal matters? 11 11 Foundation. THE WITNESS: That is correct. 12 A. It's been so long, Counselor, I don't 12 remember. I don't believe I have. I don't 13 BY MS. SAMUELS: 13 Q. Okay. After the 24th District, what 14 14 think so. 15 was your next area of assignment? 15 Q. Okay. While you were working -- are A. I was assigned to the polygraph unit. there any courses or is there anything you are 16 16 17 Q. All right. And that would have been 17 required to do to maintain your certification as 18 in or around 1999? 18 a polygraph examiner? A. Through the State of Illinois I have 19 A. I believe so. Somewhere around there, 19 20 yes. 20 to pay my fee. Q. Okay. Is there any, like, continuing 21 Q. All right. Where is the polygraph 21 unit based out of? coursework or updated or refresher courses you 22 22 are required to take? 23 A. At that time it was located on the 23 24 fifth floor annex of 1121 South State Street. 24 A. That I'm required to take, no.

	38		40
1	Q. Yes, sir.	1	don't know.
2	Okay. And so, at the time	2	Q. All right. How long did you report to
3	that you joined the polygraph unit in or around	3	Sergeant Conrath?
4	1999, do you recall who else was assigned to	4	A. A couple years up until his
5	work in the polygraph unit?	5	retirement.
6	A. I was transferred in with Kevin	6	Q. Who replaced Sergeant Conrath?
7	Howley.	7	A. Sergeant Ricardo Pabone.
8	Q. Okay.	8	Q. P-a-b-o-n-e?
9	A. And I believe we were we were	9	A. I believe. I don't know if there's an
10	replacing two gentlemen, John Scout and Robert	10	E on there or not, ma'am.
11	Tovar. However, they were also helping out in	11	Q. Okay. And how long did you report to
12	the unit on a part-time basis.	12	Sergeant Pabone?
13	Q. So at the time that you joined the	13	A. That was a couple years as well.
14	unit, were the only two, I guess, full-time	14	Q. How long were you assigned to the
15	members you and Howley?	15	polygraph unit?
16	A. Yes.	16	A. I believe my total time in the
17	Q. Okay. Did you have a supervisor or	17	polygraph unit was a little bit under 15 years.
18	someone you would normally report to while you	18	Q. Okay. So roughly from '99 to 2014?
19	worked for the polygraph unit?	19	A. Yes.
20	A. Well, the polygraph unit was part of	20	Q. Where did you go after the polygraph
21	the Forensic Services Division. We had a	21	unit?
22	general string of chain of command.	22	A. The 6th District.
23	Q. All right. And who was the person you	23	Q. What was your job title when you
24	were responsible for reporting to?	24	transferred to the 6th District?
1	39	1	41
1	A. At that time I was reporting to	1	A. Sergeant of police.
2	Sergeant Curtis Gray.  Q. Okay. And how long, if you recall,	2 3	Q. What role did you have as a sergeant in the 6th District?
4	was Sergeant Gray your immediate supervisor?	4	A. I was supervising units on the streets
5	A. I cannot tell you. Up until his	5	in the I was the desk sergeant. I was over
6	retirement, which I don't recall.	6	all patrol.
7	Q. Who is your next supervisor after	7	Q. How long were you a sergeant in the
8	Curtis Gray?	8	6th District?
O			Our District:
a	A I've been it was I joutenant Igal		
9	A. I've been it was Lieutenant Jack	9	A. For about one year.
10	Huels.	10	<ul><li>A. For about one year.</li><li>Q. Where did you go after that?</li></ul>
10 11	Huels. Q. I'm sorry. Can you spell his last	10	<ul><li>A. For about one year.</li><li>Q. Where did you go after that?</li><li>A. I was transferred to the Central</li></ul>
10 11 12	Huels. Q. I'm sorry. Can you spell his last name?	10 11 12	<ul><li>A. For about one year.</li><li>Q. Where did you go after that?</li><li>A. I was transferred to the Central</li><li>Detention Unit, 18th and State.</li></ul>
10 11 12 13	Huels. Q. I'm sorry. Can you spell his last name? A. H-u-e-l-s.	10 11 12 13	<ul> <li>A. For about one year.</li> <li>Q. Where did you go after that?</li> <li>A. I was transferred to the Central</li> <li>Detention Unit, 18th and State.</li> <li>Q. Were you still a sergeant?</li> </ul>
10 11 12 13 14	Huels. Q. I'm sorry. Can you spell his last name? A. H-u-e-l-s. Q. And how long did you report to	10 11 12 13 14	<ul> <li>A. For about one year.</li> <li>Q. Where did you go after that?</li> <li>A. I was transferred to the Central</li> <li>Detention Unit, 18th and State.</li> <li>Q. Were you still a sergeant?</li> <li>A. Yes.</li> </ul>
10 11 12 13 14 15	Huels. Q. I'm sorry. Can you spell his last name? A. H-u-e-l-s. Q. And how long did you report to Lieutenant Huels?	10 11 12 13 14 15	<ul> <li>A. For about one year.</li> <li>Q. Where did you go after that?</li> <li>A. I was transferred to the Central</li> <li>Detention Unit, 18th and State.</li> <li>Q. Were you still a sergeant?</li> <li>A. Yes.</li> <li>Q. All right. What did you do at the</li> </ul>
10 11 12 13 14 15	Huels. Q. I'm sorry. Can you spell his last name? A. H-u-e-l-s. Q. And how long did you report to Lieutenant Huels? A. I want to say up until his retirement.	10 11 12 13 14 15 16	<ul> <li>A. For about one year.</li> <li>Q. Where did you go after that?</li> <li>A. I was transferred to the Central</li> <li>Detention Unit, 18th and State.</li> <li>Q. Were you still a sergeant?</li> <li>A. Yes.</li> <li>Q. All right. What did you do at the</li> <li>Central Detention Unit?</li> </ul>
10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Huels. Q. I'm sorry. Can you spell his last name? A. H-u-e-l-s. Q. And how long did you report to Lieutenant Huels? A. I want to say up until his retirement. I don't know. Couple years.	10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	A. For about one year. Q. Where did you go after that? A. I was transferred to the Central Detention Unit, 18th and State. Q. Were you still a sergeant? A. Yes. Q. All right. What did you do at the Central Detention Unit? A. I was the shift supervisor, the
10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Huels. Q. I'm sorry. Can you spell his last name? A. H-u-e-l-s. Q. And how long did you report to Lieutenant Huels? A. I want to say up until his retirement. I don't know. Couple years. Q. Who was your supervisor after	10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. For about one year. Q. Where did you go after that? A. I was transferred to the Central Detention Unit, 18th and State. Q. Were you still a sergeant? A. Yes. Q. All right. What did you do at the Central Detention Unit? A. I was the shift supervisor, the afternoon shift supervisor. Afternoon,
10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Huels. Q. I'm sorry. Can you spell his last name? A. H-u-e-l-s. Q. And how long did you report to Lieutenant Huels? A. I want to say up until his retirement. I don't know. Couple years. Q. Who was your supervisor after Lieutenant Huels?	10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. For about one year. Q. Where did you go after that? A. I was transferred to the Central Detention Unit, 18th and State. Q. Were you still a sergeant? A. Yes. Q. All right. What did you do at the Central Detention Unit? A. I was the shift supervisor, the afternoon shift supervisor. Afternoon, sometimes midnight, sometimes days. We were a
10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Huels. Q. I'm sorry. Can you spell his last name? A. H-u-e-l-s. Q. And how long did you report to Lieutenant Huels? A. I want to say up until his retirement. I don't know. Couple years. Q. Who was your supervisor after Lieutenant Huels? A. Well, Lieutenant Huels and Sergeant	10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	A. For about one year. Q. Where did you go after that? A. I was transferred to the Central Detention Unit, 18th and State. Q. Were you still a sergeant? A. Yes. Q. All right. What did you do at the Central Detention Unit? A. I was the shift supervisor, the afternoon shift supervisor. Afternoon, sometimes midnight, sometimes days. We were a little short handed at that time.
10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Huels. Q. I'm sorry. Can you spell his last name? A. H-u-e-l-s. Q. And how long did you report to Lieutenant Huels? A. I want to say up until his retirement. I don't know. Couple years. Q. Who was your supervisor after Lieutenant Huels? A. Well, Lieutenant Huels and Sergeant Gray were my chain of command.	10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A. For about one year. Q. Where did you go after that? A. I was transferred to the Central Detention Unit, 18th and State. Q. Were you still a sergeant? A. Yes. Q. All right. What did you do at the Central Detention Unit? A. I was the shift supervisor, the afternoon shift supervisor. Afternoon, sometimes midnight, sometimes days. We were a little short handed at that time. Q. All right. Did your job
10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Huels. Q. I'm sorry. Can you spell his last name? A. H-u-e-l-s. Q. And how long did you report to Lieutenant Huels? A. I want to say up until his retirement. I don't know. Couple years. Q. Who was your supervisor after Lieutenant Huels? A. Well, Lieutenant Huels and Sergeant Gray were my chain of command. Q. Okay. So who replaced	10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A. For about one year. Q. Where did you go after that? A. I was transferred to the Central Detention Unit, 18th and State. Q. Were you still a sergeant? A. Yes. Q. All right. What did you do at the Central Detention Unit? A. I was the shift supervisor, the afternoon shift supervisor. Afternoon, sometimes midnight, sometimes days. We were a little short handed at that time. Q. All right. Did your job responsibilities change between being a sergeant
10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Huels. Q. I'm sorry. Can you spell his last name? A. H-u-e-l-s. Q. And how long did you report to Lieutenant Huels? A. I want to say up until his retirement. I don't know. Couple years. Q. Who was your supervisor after Lieutenant Huels? A. Well, Lieutenant Huels and Sergeant Gray were my chain of command.	10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A. For about one year. Q. Where did you go after that? A. I was transferred to the Central Detention Unit, 18th and State. Q. Were you still a sergeant? A. Yes. Q. All right. What did you do at the Central Detention Unit? A. I was the shift supervisor, the afternoon shift supervisor. Afternoon, sometimes midnight, sometimes days. We were a little short handed at that time. Q. All right. Did your job

11 (Pages 38 to 41)

42 44 A. Yes. A. Yes. 1 2 Q. All right. How were your job Q. All right. And what was that? 3 responsibilities different? 3 A. Just how to -- how to fill out the 4 A. I was supervising the detention aides, 4 paperwork that was required by the unit, how 5 supervising the intake of prisoners, supervising 5 to -- where to do the filing, the -- the 6 6 the transfer of prisoners from the lockup to appointment schedules, things like that. 7 7 Illinois Department of Corrections, monitoring Q. All right. 8 8 prisoners, monitoring prisoners who had tried to Was there a change in the 9 9 commit suicide, all transgender fluid prisoners paperwork you were expected to fill out when 10 were coming into our cells and pretty much about 10 doing a polygraph examination during the time 11 11 you were in that unit for the Chicago Police 12 12 Q. How long were you a sergeant for the Department? 13 13 Central Detention Unit? A. Was there a change? Most of the 14 A. Approximately four years. 14 paperwork that we were -- that we were filling 15 Q. All right. Did you do that until your 15 out stayed the same. 16 retirement? 16 Q. Okay. So --17 A. Yes, ma'am. 17 A. However -- hold on. Let me preface 18 Q. When did you stop working for Barts 18 that, ma'am. There was -- when we -- when we 19 and Associates? 19 started administering the examination to the 20 A. I believe it was 2012, 2013. 20 recruits, we had to do additional different Q. Why did you stop working for them? 21 21 paperwork other than what we were doing A. Gentleman who owned the company died. 22 22 criminally. 23 Q. Did the company close? 23 Q. Okay. So, specifically, from when 24 A. It closed. 24 you're doing criminal examinations, to your 45 43 knowledge, did the paperwork stay the same Q. While you worked at Barts and 1 1 2 2 regarding what you were expected to fill out Associates, were you ever subject to any 3 3 complaints? during the time you were in the polygraph unit 4 for the Chicago Police Department? 4 A. No. 5 5 Q. Were you ever disciplined for any 6 6 work-related infractions while working for Barts Q. Okay. And what paperwork were you 7 7 and Associates? expected to fill out for criminal polygraph 8 8 A. No. examinations? 9 Q. All right. Is there a licensing board 9 A. The things that we had at our disposal 10 or some type of agency that oversees polygraph 10 that we used was the polygraph cover, the 11 11 examiner's worksheet, the polygraph subject examiners? A. My license is issued through the 12 consent form, and then afterwards there would be 12 13 a small kind of report sent to the district. 13 Department of Professional Regulations. Q. All right. Have you ever received a Q. I'm sorry. So the cover, there's the 14 14 15 complaint from the Department of Regulation --15 worksheet, the subject consent form, and what 16 16 Department of Professional Regulations or been else? 17 subject to any investigation? 17 A. There's the examiner's worksheets. 18 A. No. 18 Q. All right. And so the polygraph 19 cover, what's that? 19 Q. All right. When you joined the polygraph unit, did you have to receive any 20 20 A. You got to show me one, ma'am, if you 21 21 additional -- I'm sorry. have one. I don't -- I've been gone there for 22 Going back to CPD now. When 22 quite some time. If you can show me something, you joined the polygraph unit, did you have to 23 23 I'll show you what it looks like and I can 24 receive any training, additional training? 24 acknowledge that that's what we used.

46 48 1 1 Q. Okay. Polygraph worksheet, what's MR. MILLER: He's just got a bad back, 2 2 so he's got to take a break. So five minutes. that? 3 3 A. That's a worksheet that the examiners Like 11:05. 4 would use during the administration of their 4 (WHEREUPON, a brief recess 5 5 was held.) examination. 6 MS. SAMUELS: Back on the record. 6 Q. Is that the graph that I showed you? 7 Is that what it is? 7 BY MS. SAMUELS: 8 8 Q. So when we left off, we were talking A. No. 9 Q. Okay. The subject consent form, I'm 9 about the type of paperwork you would expect to 10 guessing that's a form that whoever you're 10 fill out when conducting a criminal polygraph being -- whoever you're polygraphing they sign examination, correct? 11 11 12 saying they're okay with it? 12 A. Yes, ma'am. 13 A. They're consenting to be 13 Q. Okay. And those three things were the 14 administered -- they're volunteering --14 subject consent form, the worksheet, and the 15 volunteering to take the examination. 15 polygraph cover. Is that fair? Q. All right. Examiner's worksheet, 16 A. I'm sorry? 16 17 17 Q. I said the three things that you said what's that? 18 18 you would expect to fill out or complete were A. I believe we just went over that. the polygraph cover, worksheet, and the subject 19 Q. Oh. That's the same thing as the 19 20 20 consent form? other one. MR. MILLER: Objection. Form. 21 21 A. Yes, if any of that was necessary. 22 22 BY MS. SAMUELS: Sometimes it's not necessary. 23 Q. So there's three -- is it fair to say 23 Q. Okay. When would that not be 24 that there's three documents you would expect to 24 necessary? 47 49 1 fill out for a -- what -- I'll ask a different 1 A. Well, you wouldn't need to fill out an 2 2 question. examiner's worksheet if you walked in and the 3 3 Is it fair to say that there's guy says, I'm not taking your test. So you walk 4 4 three documents you would expect to fill out out. So you're done. 5 when you're conducting a criminal polygraph 5 Q. All right. So, basically, you don't 6 6 examination? do a worksheet if there's no polygraph? 7 7 A. If they're necessary. A. No. You just don't do a worksheet if 8 8 Q. Okay. Is there anything else besides you -- if the amount of time you're there 9 the polygraph cover, worksheet and subject 9 doesn't require you to fill out a sheet at that 10 consent form that you would expect to fill out 10 11 or complete when you're doing a criminal 11 Q. All right. When would you be required 12 polygraph? 12 to fill out a worksheet? 13 A. So if you're going to be administering 13 A. I believe that's it. Q. Okay. I think I have -- I'm going to the test, the worksheet is definitely required. 14 14 15 share screen again with you. 15 Q. Okay. So in May of 2000 the polygraph MR. MILLER: Do you need a break? Do 16 unit was still at 11th and State? 16 you mind if we take a break? 17 17 A. I don't know. 18 MS. SAMUELS: Sure. 18 Ma'am, I'm pretty -- I'm very bad at dates. I know we went from 11th and 19 MR. MILLER: Can we take a break? 19 20 MS. SAMUELS: Go for it. 20 State to Homan Square. At what point we went 21 21 to, I don't know. MR. MILLER: Thank you. MS. SAMUELS: How long? 22 Q. All right. Let's do it this way. Can 22 23 you describe -- was there a specific room you 23 MR. MILLER: Five minutes? 24 THE WITNESS: Yeah. 24 were -- that you always gave a polygraph in?

52 A. Yes. 1 A. We had polygraph -- we had rooms where 1 2 we administered polygraph examinations. We had Q. All right. Where would that be in 3 3 related -- where would that be located in multiple rooms. 4 Q. Okay. Were all the rooms generally 4 relation to the polygraph room? 5 the same? 5 A. Across the hall from the polygraph 6 6 MR. MILLER: Object to form. room. 7 7 THE WITNESS: The different locations Q. Okay. And I think you said there were 8 8 had different dimensions. two rooms at 11th and State. But, generally, 9 9 BY MS. SAMUELS: you would expect to see the same things in both 10 Q. Okay. Would you expect the same 10 rooms? 11 furniture and equipment to be in each room? 11 A. Yes. 12 A. For the most part, yes. 12 Q. Okay. And then the polygraph rooms at 13 Q. Okay. At 11th and State how many 13 Homan Square, how many were there? 14 different rooms were there where you would give 14 A. Two. Q. Two. 15 a polygraph examination? 15 16 A. We had two. 16 Again, would you generally 17 17 expect to see the same things in each? Q. All right, two. 18 18 Where were they in relation to A. Yes. 19 19 Q. All right. Can you describe the 20 A. They were right next to each other. 20 polygraph room at Homan Square? 21 Q. All right. And where were they in the 21 A. They had the exact same furniture that building at 11th and State? 22 22 was taken over from 11th and State to Homan 23 A. Fifth floor annex. 23 Square. The room was a tad bit smaller. They 24 Q. All right. Can you describe what the 24 installed a large, two-way mirror -- or one-way 51 53 rooms looked like? 1 mirror. I don't know what the correct term is. 1 2 2 A. At 11th and State? And there was a roll-down shade to keep the 3 O. Yes, sir. 3 mirror private -- to keep the room private. 4 A. Very old. Very old. They were --4 Q. Okay. And so -- hold on. 5 they had some -- what looked like yellowing 5 So was there one window in the 6 ceiling tile around all the walls to help 6 room or were there two? 7 eliminate noise. The desk would be actual 7 A. There were no windows in the room. Q. Okay. And so there was the -- when 8 polygraph inside it, a large chair with a tie 8 9 9 you say the one-way mirror, I'm thinking the back and arms that the subject would sit in, and 10 10 mirrors were, like, you can see out but nobody a chair that the examiner would sit in. 11 Q. All right. Do you recall if there 11 can see in? 12 were windows in the room? 12 A. No. The other way around. You could 13 13 A. Windows, no. see into the room, but the room -- you couldn't 14 Q. Okay. How many ways were there to get 14 see out of the room. 15 into the room? 15 Q. Okay. 16 A. One. 16 A. It was an observation deck. 17 Q. All right. And then the door that led 17 Q. Okay. Got it. Okay. 18 into the polygraph room, what did that lead to? 18 And where were -- where was MR. MILLER: Object to form. your office in relation to the polygraph rooms 19 19 THE WITNESS: What -- what did the --20 20 at Homan Square? what was outside the polygraph room? A hallway. 21 21 A. Right next to the polygraph room. 22 BY MS. SAMUELS: 22 Q. Was your office on the other side of 23 23 Q. Did you have an office at 11th and the mirror? 24 State? 24 A. Yes.

54 56 1 Q. Okay. So when -- okay. you with, like, questions that they would want 2 How would you expect to 2 you to ask? 3 receive an assignment to conduct a polygraph? 3 A. No. 4 A. Detectives would call for 4 Q. Okay. So what would they tell you? 5 appointments. 5 A. It all depends. 6 6 Q. Okay. What type of information would Q. And that would be the general practice 7 7 in or around May of 2000? they tell you? 8 8 A. I believe so. Yes. A. They would give me an RD number. 9 9 Q. All right. And when they called for Sometimes they would have a case report 10 appointments, what information would you need in 10 available to me. Time, date, place, the type of 11 order to set up an appointment? 11 incident, the issue. It could be a theft. It 12 A. We would discuss availability. We 12 could be an auto accident. It could be a sexual 13 13 would discuss with the -- I would discuss with abuse. It could be a child abuse. It could be 14 the detectives whether it was of an immediate 14 a homicide. Where, when, the victim, if there 15 importance or if they could schedule it at a 15 was a victim in some cases, the -- the, you 16 later time or date, how many people they were 16 know, the particulars on the person who I'm looking to have tested. Maybe I'd put the RD 17 17 giving the examination to. 18 number down there, contact phone number, what 18 Q. Okay. And how would you determine 19 area they were from. 19 what questions -- what questions to ask? 20 Q. Okay. And where would this 20 A. That would be -- well, with the 21 information be recorded? 21 detectives they would want to know what -- a 22 22 A. In our schedule book. certain issue, a lot of times, not necessarily 23 Q. And is that literally just like a book 23 the particular question. And then I would -- I 24 where you'd write down information? 24 develop my questions while I was talking to the 55 57 A. Yes. 1 individual inside the polygraph room. 1 2 2 Q. Okay. Q. Okay. So, essentially, they would 3 All right. And then after a 3 brief you on the case and tell you about an polygraph is scheduled, then what would be the 4 4 issue, and then while you are doing the 5 5 polygraph you would sort of fill out what 6 6 A. The next step where? What do you specific questions to ask? 7 mean? 7 A. While I was talking to the individual 8 Q. What would you expect to be the next 8 person, I would formulate my questions. 9 thing to happen in order to conduct a polygraph? 9 Q. Okay. 10 A. Well, if a detective makes an 10 All right. While you're 11 appointment with me, he will bring the person to 11 talking to the detective before the polygraph 12 12 examination, was it your general practice to 13 Q. Okay. And after the detective brings 13 take notes? 14 the person who's going to be the subject of the 14 A. Sometimes yes. Sometimes no. It all 15 examination, what would you expect to happen 15 depends. 16 after that? 16 Q. What are some factors that would 17 A. The subject would be placed in a 17 determine whether or not you took notes? 18 polygraph examination room. The detectives 18 A. The complexity of the case, whether I 19 would accompany me to my office where they would 19 have already been involved in it in some degree 20 appraise [sic] me of whatever information is --20 or a couple of them. Quite a few reasons. 21 I needed or is necessary for me to give my 21 Q. And so if this was the first time you 22 examination. 22 were involved in a case, would you expect 23 23 Q. Okay. And so, essentially, the yourself to take notes? 24 detectives would tell you -- would they provide 24 A. It all depends.

58 60 1 Q. All right. After you sort of have the 1 After they know what the test 2 meeting with the detectives, then what would you 2 is all about and they understand, I will attach 3 expect to be the next step in conducting a 3 them to the examination -- to the machine and I 4 polygraph examination? 4 will administer the actual examination to them. 5 A. I would go into the polygraph room 5 Q. Okay. So I believe you said this 6 6 where the subject was. portion is considered the pretest interview? 7 7 Q. All right. And then what? A. Yes, ma'am. 8 A. I would introduce myself. 8 Q. Okay. And when you're doing the 9 9 Q. Then what? pretest interview, are you ever -- are you 10 A. I would explain to the person who was 10 talking to them generally? Are you talking 11 being administered the test that this was a 11 about the case or both? 12 voluntary thing and he didn't have to do it if 12 MR. MILLER: Object to form. 13 13 THE WITNESS: I don't know what you he didn't want to. If he agreed, I would then 14 present him with the polygraph subject consent 14 mean by "generally." 15 form, at which time I would read the entire 15 BY MS. SAMUELS: 16 thing to him, verbatim for the most part. The 16 Q. Sure. So let me ask -- let me just 17 only thing I would change is during the Miranda 17 ask this. 18 warnings, I change it from first person to 18 So during the pretest 19 third. Instead of I, I'd say you. If they 19 interview, are you talking to them about the 20 agreed I would request that they sign this 20 case or the reason why they are -- are you 21 21 talking to them about the criminal case? document. 22 22 Q. Okay. And then what? A. Yes. 23 A. We would have a conversation. 23 Q. Okay. And as you're talking to them 24 Q. Okay. And when you say you would have 24 about the criminal case, I think you said that's 59 1 a conversation, what does that mean or what does 1 when you begin to develop the specific questions 2 2 that consist of? you're going to ask during the examination? 3 A. The purpose of the pretest interview 3 A. During the conversation that I'm 4 4 is to get the person accustomed to talking to having with them questions start to develop, 5 me, to make sure that they know specifically why 5 6 6 they are there, what the issue at hand is, to Q. Okay. And when you say -- I think you 7 ask questions so that if they have other 7 said "sustainability questions." What does that 8 8 information that they want to get out of their mean or what's that referring to? 9 system or -- I shouldn't say out of their 9 A. Suitability. 10 system. That's a bad way to put it. If they 10 Q. Suitability. I'm sorry. 11 want to convey other information that they may 11 When you say "suitability 12 have forgot or whatever, they could do it now. 12 questions," what's that referring to? 13 During this time we develop the actual questions 13 A. I ask them questions to make sure that 14 14 that we're going to ask them on the polygraph they're okay at that point in time to be able to 15 examination. 15 take the examination. 16 16 I then go through some Q. Okay. So, for instance, if somebody was intoxicated you wouldn't give them an 17 suitability questions with them. At which time 17 18 after I feel, based on my suitability issues, 18 examination? 19 that they are okay to take the examination, I 19 A. That is correct. 20 will review the questions with them to help them 20 Q. All right. What are some other understand they have the right to change them at 21 21 indications you might see that someone should 22 any time, adjust them, to do whatever they need 22 not take a polygraph? 23 23 to, and help them -- to help them to pass the A. Drug withdrawals is one. If 24 test. 24 there's -- if they have major -- you know,

62 1 congestive heart failure, there's health issues 1 they'd be bringing him to me in the first place. 2 that might have a problem, if they cannot sit 2 Q. Okay. And so those sort of things you 3 3 would expect the detective to weed out? for a long period of time, if they have pain 4 issues, if they -- if they are falling asleep 4 A. Yeah, common sense. Sure. 5 during the interview, if they're belligerent, if 5 Q. Okay. And then after the pretest 6 6 they're hostile. Those are just some of them. interview, I think you said after that is when 7 7 Q. Do you have to take into consideration you would do the actual test? 8 cognitive function when determining whether 8 A. Yes. 9 9 someone could take a polygraph? Q. Okay. Generally speaking, how long 10 MR. MILLER: Object to form. 10 would the pretest interview last? THE WITNESS: What do you mean 11 11 A. Generally speaking, it could last from 12 12 "cognitive function?" twenty minutes to three hours. 13 13 Q. Okay. So it really just depends? BY MS. SAMUELS: 14 Q. So, like, somebody's ability to 14 A. It really just depends. 15 understand the questions that they are being 15 Q. Why might a pretest interview take 16 16 three hours? 17 A. If they are not understanding the 17 A. Depends on how much the person has to 18 18 question and they are conveying to me that they say. 19 are not understanding the question, there's no 19 Q. Okay. And same question. How long 20 20 would you expect the actual polygraph reason -- there's no way that I can administer a 21 examination to last? test. So I would probably have to say I think 21 22 22 probably yeah. That is -- that could be one of A. That depends. 23 23 Q. It really just depends on the number 24 Q. Okay. Other than instances where the 24 of questions being asked? 65 63 1 individual has conveyed their inability to 1 A. Depends on the number of examinations 2 2 that are being issued. understand questioning, do you recall any 3 Q. And when you say "examinations," those 3 instances where you got someone who wasn't able 4 to understand what was going on, and so you 4 are the questions that are being asked? 5 didn't provide -- you didn't provide a polygraph 5 A. Yes. The number of times that the examination? 6 6 test is being run. 7 7 A. Okay. So you're saying -- I'm a Q. Oh, okay. When you are --8 8 little bit confused, Counselor. You're saying What does that mean, the 9 that have I experienced someone not understand 9 number of times the test is being run? 10 my questions? Is that what you're saying? 10 A. Well, after we attach a person to the 11 11 polygraph and we start asking the questions and I don't understand. If you 12 can explain what you're saying. 12 recording the physiology, that is one 13 O. Right. 13 examination. It usually lasts between three and 14 And so, I guess what I'm 14 four minutes. State law requires that we 15 thinking of is an individual who may have a lack 15 administer a minimum of two examinations. 16 of learning or understanding, despite being an 16 However, we could actually administer up to six 17 adult, and you realize that they -- they're 17 if we need to. 18 incapable of understanding the questions that 18 Q. Okay. And so does each -- what are --19 you're asking. Does that make sense? 19 what is each examination comprised of? 20 20 A. Okay. So most likely that would have A. The questions that were developed on 21 already been hashed out from the detectives who 21 the examination -- on the pretest. 22 were working the case. And if the detectives 22 Q. Okay. And so for each examination are 23 23 thought that this person was not cognitively you asking the same questions? 24 able to understand, I don't necessarily think 24 A. Yes.

17 (Pages 62 to 65)

66 68 1 Q. I'm sorry? 1 BY MS. SAMUELS: 2 2 Q. Okay. A. Yes. 3 3 Q. Is there a limit or recommendation for And then you said each 4 how many questions you're supposed to ask per 4 examination has to be done at least twice, but 5 examination? 5 it can be done up to six times, correct? 6 6 A. Usually the maximum is 11. A. Yes. 7 7 Q. All right. When you're giving an Q. Okay. And as you're doing each examination, would you expect each question to 8 8 examination, are you recording the responses 9 9 be a yes or no answer? somewhere? 10 A. Correct. 10 A. Yes. Q. Okay. Are there any other best 11 Q. All right. Where are the responses 11 12 practices related to questions that should --12 recorded? that are asked during examination? 13 13 A. On that sheet of paper that you showed 14 MR. MILLER: Object to form. 14 me. On paper. Like at the time, 2000, on 15 Incomplete hypothetical. 15 paper, like that sheet of paper that you showed THE WITNESS: Best practices. What 16 16 exactly do you mean by "best practices?" 17 17 Q. Okay. The graph with the heart rate 18 BY MS. SAMUELS: 18 and all that other stuff? 19 Q. So, for instance, if I asked somebody 19 A. Yes. 20 an open-ended question that would -- I'm 20 Q. Okay. assuming that would not be the type of question 21 21 A. Yes. Q. Okay. During the pretest interview, 22 22 I should be asking, right? I should be asking 23 yes or no questions, right? 23 are you taking notes or are you recording 24 A. Yes. That's what I said, yes or no 24 anywhere what's being told? 67 69 1 1 A. In 2000 there was no recording questions. 2 2 Q. Right. available to us. There will be sometimes. It 3 And so yes or no questions 3 all depends on the note taking. 4 would be sort of the best practices or the 4 Q. Was it your general practice to take 5 expectation when you're asking somebody -- when 5 notes during the pretest interview? you're conducting a polygraph examination, fair? 6 6 A. I felt that when a person was talking 7 A. Yes. 7 to you that it was easier that they would talk 8 8 Q. Okay. Is there anything else you can to you when you weren't writing things down. So 9 think of where you would say if you're doing a 9 by not necessarily writing down every word they 10 polygraph examination this is what I would 10 said, it helped them to talk easier. Q. After the polygraph examination, then 11 expect to be done? 11 12 MR. MILLER: Object to form. 12 13 Incomplete nature of the hypothetical. 13 MR. MILLER: Object to form. THE WITNESS: At that point the 14 THE WITNESS: All questions are yes 14 15 and no. 15 examination -- I would read the results or read 16 16 the results of the chart and offer an opinion. BY MS. SAMUELS: 17 Q. Understood. 17 BY MS. SAMUELS: 18 Is there anything else about 18 Q. So are you reading the results to the 19 the questioning or the style of the examination 19 person being examined or to detectives? that you would expect to see in a polygraph 20 20 A. I'm looking at the results to 21 21 examination? determine whether there's truth or deception. 22 MR. MILLER: Same objection. 22 And then I will, depending on how the detectives 23 THE WITNESS: Based on your question, 23 request, I'll either let the person know or I'll 24 I'm going to have to say no. 24 let the detectives know.

70 1 Q. Okay. So is it fair to say as you're 1 A. They would also be on the back of the 2 doing the examination you are not evaluating it, 2 examiner's worksheet. 3 that you do the evaluation after you have 3 Q. Okay. Did you prepare at all for your 4 completed it all? 4 deposition today? 5 A. You can see when they are -- when the 5 A. Yes. 6 6 chart is being recorded a lot of times whether Q. All right. How did you prepare? 7 or not the person is reacting to certain 7 A. I'm sorry? 8 8 questions. Sometimes it's not as clear cut. So Q. How did you prepare? 9 there's sometimes when the reactions are so 9 A. Oh, I met with my attorneys. 10 10 Q. When did you meet with them? strong that you can tell right away as they are 11 coming -- as the charts are being recorded 11 A. A couple hours Monday, couple hours 12 12 whether the person is telling the truth or not, vesterday. 13 and then there are other times you can't where 13 Q. Did you review anything in preparation 14 you'll have to look at it and make a 14 for your deposition? 15 determination, you know, look at it a little bit 15 A. Yes. 16 16 Q. What did you review? closely, a little more closely. 17 17 Q. And when you say you would report your A. The paperwork for Jovanie Long's 18 results to the detectives, would you generally 18 polygraph examination. 19 do that orally? Was it a written report? How 19 Q. Anything else? A. My trial testimony at his trial. 20 would you convey the results? 20 21 Q. Do you have an independent A. At the time the test was concluded, I 21 recollection of the examination you did on 22 22 would let the detectives know orally. And then 23 later on at a later time I would generate a 23 Jovanie Long? 24 small cover-sheet-type report that I would send 24 A. No, ma'am. I do not. 71 73 1 1 Q. When you reviewed the reports and your to the detective area. 2 2 testimony, did that refresh your recollection? Q. Okay. And then after you convey the 3 3 results to the detectives, are there any further 4 Q. Is there anything about the testimony 4 steps you would take? 5 5 that you provided at Jovanie Long's trial that A. Like what? 6 6 you thought was inaccurate? Q. I have no idea. I'm just asking. 7 A. Well, if there's detectives that want 7 A. No. 8 8 me to go in and -- look, for example, if a Q. Based upon the testimony you reviewed, 9 9 is it your understanding that Jovanie Long person didn't pass the test, they'll ask -- they 10 10 confessed to the murder of Marek Madjak during may ask to go in and talk to them, or they may 11 11 the pretest interview? go in and talk to them themselves while they're 12 still in the polygraph room. Other than that, 12 A. I believe that's what the paperwork 13 my -- my interaction with that person is done. 13 says. Yes. 14 Q. All right. Assuming that you took 14 Q. And so that would have been before you 15 notes during a pretest interview or any other 15 asked him any questions? 16 part of the polygraph examination, what would 16 A. Before I asked him any questions? 17 you do with those notes? 17 18 A. They would be on the back of the 18 A. You -- I don't understand. So you 19 19 mean, like, he just spontaneously jumped up and examiner's worksheet, and then they would be 20 20 decided to confess? I don't understand what you filed along with all of the other paperwork. 21 21 Q. And assuming you took notes during the mean, ma'am. 22 session with the detectives, where they apprise 22 I mean, I was -- obviously, I 23 23 was talking to the gentleman. I don't know to you of what happened, what would you do with 24 those notes? 24 what extent I was talking to him during the

19 (Pages 70 to 73)

	74		76
1	pretest. Somewhere during that he made the	1	A. And then the stuff on the bottom would
2	admission to me.	2	be after the person left.
3	Q. Is it common for people to make	3	Q. All right. And so would you expect to
4	admissions during the pretest interview?	4	fill out a polygraph case review in every
5	A. I don't know if the word common is a	5	instance when you are doing a polygraph
6	thing, but it does occur.	6	examination?
7	Q. Okay. So I'm sharing with you the	7	A. Yes.
8	report. Can you see this?	8	Q. Okay. And that's regardless of
9	A. Yes.	9	whether or not an examination is completed?
10	Q. And this looks like is this the	10	A. Yes.
11	cover sheet you were talking about?	11	Q. Okay. And so the top information is
12	A. Yes.	12	the date and time, essentially, that you first
13	Q. Okay. And so this would be completed	13	meet with the individual. Is that fair to say?
14	after you're done with an examination?	14	A. Yes.
15	A. Yes.	15	Q. Okay. And it looks like for Jovanie
16	Q. All right. And in this instance it	16	Long that was 8:15 on August 5th, 2000?
17	says examination results was no examination?	17	A. Actually, it was more when he was
18	A. That is correct.	18	brought into the office or the time that I got
19	Q. Do you recall the first time someone,	19	into the office that day. However, it may be.
20	I guess, had made an admission that didn't	20	Q. Let me ask it this way.
21	require you to take a polygraph examination?	21	Did you have a general or a
22	A. No, ma'am. I don't.	22	standard practice for how you would fill out a
23	Q. Has that happened before?	23	polygraph case review?
24	MR. MILLER: Object to form. Before	24	A. In regards to what?
	THE PROPERTY OF THE PROPERTY O		The Tregards to What
	75		77
1	what?	1	Q. The information that you would expect
2	BY MS. SAMUELS:	1	
		2	it to contain?
3	Q. So other than Jovanie, are there other	3	it to contain?  A. We would fill in the necessary
3 4	Q. So other than Jovanie, are there other people who have made admissions that didn't		
		3	A. We would fill in the necessary
4	people who have made admissions that didn't	3 4	A. We would fill in the necessary parameters on that sheet.
4 5	people who have made admissions that didn't require a polygraph examination?	3 4 5	A. We would fill in the necessary parameters on that sheet. Q. All right.
4 5 6	people who have made admissions that didn't require a polygraph examination?  A. Yes.	3 4 5 6	A. We would fill in the necessary parameters on that sheet.  Q. All right.  And so the box that says "in,"
4 5 6 7	people who have made admissions that didn't require a polygraph examination?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And so this wasn't the first	3 4 5 6 7	A. We would fill in the necessary parameters on that sheet.  Q. All right.  And so the box that says "in," what would you what did you understand that
4 5 6 7 8	people who have made admissions that didn't require a polygraph examination?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And so this wasn't the first time that this has happened to you, is that fair	3 4 5 6 7 8	A. We would fill in the necessary parameters on that sheet.  Q. All right.  And so the box that says "in," what would you what did you understand that box to mean?
4 5 6 7 8 9	people who have made admissions that didn't require a polygraph examination?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And so this wasn't the first time that this has happened to you, is that fair to say, Jovanie Long making an admission?	3 4 5 6 7 8	A. We would fill in the necessary parameters on that sheet. Q. All right. And so the box that says "in," what would you what did you understand that box to mean? A. That's when the individual came in
4 5 6 7 8 9	people who have made admissions that didn't require a polygraph examination?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And so this wasn't the first time that this has happened to you, is that fair to say, Jovanie Long making an admission?  A. I don't know at what point Jovanie was	3 4 5 6 7 8 9	A. We would fill in the necessary parameters on that sheet. Q. All right. And so the box that says "in," what would you what did you understand that box to mean? A. That's when the individual came in with the detectives and was placed in the room.
4 5 6 7 8 9 10	people who have made admissions that didn't require a polygraph examination?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And so this wasn't the first time that this has happened to you, is that fair to say, Jovanie Long making an admission?  A. I don't know at what point Jovanie was there, whether or not people had made statements	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	A. We would fill in the necessary parameters on that sheet. Q. All right. And so the box that says "in," what would you what did you understand that box to mean? A. That's when the individual came in with the detectives and was placed in the room. Q. Okay. And the box that says "out,"
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	people who have made admissions that didn't require a polygraph examination?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And so this wasn't the first time that this has happened to you, is that fair to say, Jovanie Long making an admission?  A. I don't know at what point Jovanie was there, whether or not people had made statements to me before I talked to Jovanie or after, I	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	A. We would fill in the necessary parameters on that sheet.  Q. All right.  And so the box that says "in," what would you what did you understand that box to mean?  A. That's when the individual came in with the detectives and was placed in the room.  Q. Okay. And the box that says "out," what did you understand that to mean?
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	people who have made admissions that didn't require a polygraph examination?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And so this wasn't the first time that this has happened to you, is that fair to say, Jovanie Long making an admission?  A. I don't know at what point Jovanie was there, whether or not people had made statements to me before I talked to Jovanie or after, I don't know. I can't say this was the first,	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	A. We would fill in the necessary parameters on that sheet.  Q. All right.  And so the box that says "in," what would you what did you understand that box to mean?  A. That's when the individual came in with the detectives and was placed in the room.  Q. Okay. And the box that says "out," what did you understand that to mean?  A. That's when he left my office.
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	people who have made admissions that didn't require a polygraph examination?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And so this wasn't the first time that this has happened to you, is that fair to say, Jovanie Long making an admission?  A. I don't know at what point Jovanie was there, whether or not people had made statements to me before I talked to Jovanie or after, I don't know. I can't say this was the first, second, third, fourth, last. I just don't have	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	A. We would fill in the necessary parameters on that sheet.  Q. All right.  And so the box that says "in," what would you what did you understand that box to mean?  A. That's when the individual came in with the detectives and was placed in the room.  Q. Okay. And the box that says "out," what did you understand that to mean?  A. That's when he left my office.  Q. Okay. And so that's not necessarily
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	people who have made admissions that didn't require a polygraph examination?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And so this wasn't the first time that this has happened to you, is that fair to say, Jovanie Long making an admission?  A. I don't know at what point Jovanie was there, whether or not people had made statements to me before I talked to Jovanie or after, I don't know. I can't say this was the first, second, third, fourth, last. I just don't have that information.	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	A. We would fill in the necessary parameters on that sheet.  Q. All right.  And so the box that says "in," what would you what did you understand that box to mean?  A. That's when the individual came in with the detectives and was placed in the room.  Q. Okay. And the box that says "out," what did you understand that to mean?  A. That's when he left my office.  Q. Okay. And so that's not necessarily the time you complete the polygraph examination,
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	people who have made admissions that didn't require a polygraph examination?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And so this wasn't the first time that this has happened to you, is that fair to say, Jovanie Long making an admission?  A. I don't know at what point Jovanie was there, whether or not people had made statements to me before I talked to Jovanie or after, I don't know. I can't say this was the first, second, third, fourth, last. I just don't have that information.  Q. All right. Is this the worksheet you	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	A. We would fill in the necessary parameters on that sheet.  Q. All right.  And so the box that says "in," what would you what did you understand that box to mean?  A. That's when the individual came in with the detectives and was placed in the room.  Q. Okay. And the box that says "out," what did you understand that to mean?  A. That's when he left my office.  Q. Okay. And so that's not necessarily the time you complete the polygraph examination, but that's the time he leaves the polygraph
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	people who have made admissions that didn't require a polygraph examination?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And so this wasn't the first time that this has happened to you, is that fair to say, Jovanie Long making an admission?  A. I don't know at what point Jovanie was there, whether or not people had made statements to me before I talked to Jovanie or after, I don't know. I can't say this was the first, second, third, fourth, last. I just don't have that information.  Q. All right. Is this the worksheet you were talking about?	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	A. We would fill in the necessary parameters on that sheet.  Q. All right.  And so the box that says "in," what would you what did you understand that box to mean?  A. That's when the individual came in with the detectives and was placed in the room.  Q. Okay. And the box that says "out," what did you understand that to mean?  A. That's when he left my office.  Q. Okay. And so that's not necessarily the time you complete the polygraph examination, but that's the time he leaves the polygraph section. Is that fair?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And, again, 8:15 isn't the time
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	people who have made admissions that didn't require a polygraph examination?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And so this wasn't the first time that this has happened to you, is that fair to say, Jovanie Long making an admission?  A. I don't know at what point Jovanie was there, whether or not people had made statements to me before I talked to Jovanie or after, I don't know. I can't say this was the first, second, third, fourth, last. I just don't have that information.  Q. All right. Is this the worksheet you were talking about?  A. This is the case review.	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	A. We would fill in the necessary parameters on that sheet.  Q. All right.  And so the box that says "in," what would you what did you understand that box to mean?  A. That's when the individual came in with the detectives and was placed in the room.  Q. Okay. And the box that says "out," what did you understand that to mean?  A. That's when he left my office.  Q. Okay. And so that's not necessarily the time you complete the polygraph examination, but that's the time he leaves the polygraph section. Is that fair?  A. Yes.
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	people who have made admissions that didn't require a polygraph examination?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And so this wasn't the first time that this has happened to you, is that fair to say, Jovanie Long making an admission?  A. I don't know at what point Jovanie was there, whether or not people had made statements to me before I talked to Jovanie or after, I don't know. I can't say this was the first, second, third, fourth, last. I just don't have that information.  Q. All right. Is this the worksheet you were talking about?  A. This is the case review.  Q. Okay. When would you fill out a	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. We would fill in the necessary parameters on that sheet.  Q. All right.  And so the box that says "in," what would you what did you understand that box to mean?  A. That's when the individual came in with the detectives and was placed in the room.  Q. Okay. And the box that says "out," what did you understand that to mean?  A. That's when he left my office.  Q. Okay. And so that's not necessarily the time you complete the polygraph examination, but that's the time he leaves the polygraph section. Is that fair?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And, again, 8:15 isn't the time
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	people who have made admissions that didn't require a polygraph examination?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And so this wasn't the first time that this has happened to you, is that fair to say, Jovanie Long making an admission?  A. I don't know at what point Jovanie was there, whether or not people had made statements to me before I talked to Jovanie or after, I don't know. I can't say this was the first, second, third, fourth, last. I just don't have that information.  Q. All right. Is this the worksheet you were talking about?  A. This is the case review.  Q. Okay. When would you fill out a polygraph case review?	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	A. We would fill in the necessary parameters on that sheet.  Q. All right.  And so the box that says "in," what would you what did you understand that box to mean?  A. That's when the individual came in with the detectives and was placed in the room.  Q. Okay. And the box that says "out," what did you understand that to mean?  A. That's when he left my office.  Q. Okay. And so that's not necessarily the time you complete the polygraph examination, but that's the time he leaves the polygraph section. Is that fair?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And, again, 8:15 isn't the time you begin the examination, it's the time he's
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	people who have made admissions that didn't require a polygraph examination?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And so this wasn't the first time that this has happened to you, is that fair to say, Jovanie Long making an admission?  A. I don't know at what point Jovanie was there, whether or not people had made statements to me before I talked to Jovanie or after, I don't know. I can't say this was the first, second, third, fourth, last. I just don't have that information.  Q. All right. Is this the worksheet you were talking about?  A. This is the case review.  Q. Okay. When would you fill out a polygraph case review?  A. A lot of the information on the top of	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A. We would fill in the necessary parameters on that sheet.  Q. All right.  And so the box that says "in," what would you what did you understand that box to mean?  A. That's when the individual came in with the detectives and was placed in the room.  Q. Okay. And the box that says "out," what did you understand that to mean?  A. That's when he left my office.  Q. Okay. And so that's not necessarily the time you complete the polygraph examination, but that's the time he leaves the polygraph section. Is that fair?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And, again, 8:15 isn't the time you begin the examination, it's the time he's brought into the polygraph section. Fair?
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	people who have made admissions that didn't require a polygraph examination?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And so this wasn't the first time that this has happened to you, is that fair to say, Jovanie Long making an admission?  A. I don't know at what point Jovanie was there, whether or not people had made statements to me before I talked to Jovanie or after, I don't know. I can't say this was the first, second, third, fourth, last. I just don't have that information.  Q. All right. Is this the worksheet you were talking about?  A. This is the case review.  Q. Okay. When would you fill out a polygraph case review?  A. A lot of the information on the top of that page would be given to me and gleaned when	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A. We would fill in the necessary parameters on that sheet.  Q. All right.  And so the box that says "in," what would you what did you understand that box to mean?  A. That's when the individual came in with the detectives and was placed in the room.  Q. Okay. And the box that says "out," what did you understand that to mean?  A. That's when he left my office.  Q. Okay. And so that's not necessarily the time you complete the polygraph examination, but that's the time he leaves the polygraph section. Is that fair?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. And, again, 8:15 isn't the time you begin the examination, it's the time he's brought into the polygraph section. Fair?  A. Yes.

78 80 A. Yes. 1 1 you would -- that information you would get 2 during the time that the case that you take 2 Q. Why did you place your initials there? the -- that you take the -- that's the time that 3 A. To indicate that I was the person who 3 4 they scheduled it, correct? 4 filled it all out. 5 A. No. 5 Q. Okay. And then when it says subject 6 6 Q. Okay. When would you get that stated he did shoot victim during the course of 7 information? 7 a robbery, what does that mean or indicate to 8 8 A. When the detectives give me the 9 information which is immediately prior to 9 A. That indicates that he told me that he 10 administering the test. 10 had shot this gentleman during the course of a Q. Okay. Same with the "victim" and 11 11 robbery. 12 "location," is that when you get that 12 Q. Okay. I guess, is it -- do you know 13 information? 13 that that occurred during the pretest period because it says "no examination?" 14 14 A. Yes. 15 Q. All right. Same with "manner" and 15 A. Yes. "date and time," is that when you would get that 16 Q. All right. And so say during the 16 examination someone makes an inculpatory 17 information? 17 18 A. Yes. 18 statement, would you continue on with the 19 Q. Okay. Regarding "subject, address, 19 examination? 20 sex, race, age," when would you get that 20 MR. MILLER: Object to the nature --21 incomplete nature of the hypothetical, but go information? 21 22 22 A. Same time. ahead. 23 Q. Okay. "Investigator and agency," when 23 THE WITNESS: If what you're saying is 24 would you get that information? 24 while I'm administering the examination the 79 81 1 1 person actually says something inculpatory, I A. At the same time. 2 Q. Regarding "remarks," what information 2 would immediately stop the examination and talk 3 would you put into remarks? 3 to them. BY MS. SAMUELS: 4 A. I would put something very general 4 5 concerning the incident. Sometimes if 5 Q. Okay. And if that were the case, how 6 6 would you define it? Would it still be no there's -- if I've done multiple tests, I just 7 make -- I say it's an ongoing investigation at 7 examination? Would it say partial examination? 8 this point. Somehow the detectives convey to me 8 What would it say? 9 that he was a possible offender. 9 MR. MILLER: Same objection. 10 Q. Okay. And so remarks would be 10 THE WITNESS: Well, it all depends on whether the examination was completed or not. 11 information that you learned from the 11 Sometimes the person makes -- you know, may make 12 detectives. Is that fair to say? 12 13 A. Yes. 13 statements that are not necessarily in their own Q. Okay. And then "results," that is -best interest, but it doesn't go to the issue at 14 14 15 would be done generally after an examination is 15 hand. So you would hash it out and then 16 completed, correct? 16 continue on with the examination. 17 A. Yes. 17 Sometimes the person --18 Q. Okay. So everything before results 18 sometimes the person says, I'm done, I don't you would expect to be completed before you 19 want to do it, okay. We take it off and he's 19 begin an examination? 20 20 done. 21 21 A. Yes. If we have administered two 22 Q. And then it says "Results: No 22 examinations, then we are clearly seen on the 23 examination," and in parenthesis are your 23 chart, then that is a polygraph examination. 24 initials. Is that fair to say? 24 That is a legal polygraph that we could try to

82 84 1 score, and so we would be -- there would be an 1 MR. MILLER: Object. Asked and 2 examination. 2 answered. 3 BY MS. SAMUELS: 3 THE WITNESS: When there is no 4 Q. Right. 4 information that needs to be put on there that 5 And so I guess my question is, 5 has been given yet. 6 6 BY MS. SAMUELS: when you begin an examination, but for whatever 7 reason you don't get to the two complete 7 Q. Okay. 8 examinations that are required, how would that 8 And so did you have a common 9 9 be indicated or what would you expect to see custom or practice that you used to fill out a 10 written on the polygraph case review? 10 polygraph examiner's worksheet? 11 A. That is an interesting question. I 11 MR. MILLER: Object to form. 12 don't know how necessarily -- I'm sure that 12 THE WITNESS: Did I have shorthand? 13 would be earmarked just the way you said it, you 13 Did I put different questions in the same spot? 14 know. During whatever test he declined, decided 14 15 he didn't want to do it anymore, so the 15 BY MS. SAMUELS: 16 examination was terminated. 16 Q. Okay. And so it's fair to say -- I 17 17 understand you didn't conduct this examination, Q. Okay. And then turning to the next 18 page, this is the polygraph consent form? 18 but this is the only example I have. 19 19 So for a polygraph examiner's 20 Q. And then is it fair to say you filled 20 worksheet, when would you normally put in 21 out everything except for this signature of information about the subject? 21 22 22 MR. MILLER: Object to foundation. examinee? THE WITNESS: When I was in the room. 23 A. Also the blank in number one. 23 24 Q. Okay. So the blank in number one 24 85 83 BY MS. SAMUELS: is -- I'm sorry. I didn't mean to cut you off. 1 1 2 2 Q. Okay. Would that be during the A. The blank in number one and his 3 signature are what he filled out. 3 pretest or during the actual polygraph 4 Q. Okay. And so -- and so as a polygraph 4 examination? A. No, it would be during the pretest. 5 examiner, are you competent to evaluate the 5 6 Q. Okay. And so when you're conducting a 6 results of an examination that you did not 7 conduct? 7 pretest or if you get to the point where you're 8 MR. MILLER: Object to form. 8 doing a pretest interview with someone, would 9 THE WITNESS: I am able to look at 9 you expect there to be a polygraph examiner's 10 10 worksheet completed? charts of other people and to try to make a 11 11 determination, yes. MR. MILLER: Object to foundation. BY MS. SAMUELS: 12 12 Form. 13 THE WITNESS: Yes. 13 Q. Okay. Hold on. So the polygraph examiner 14 14 BY MS. SAMUELS: 15 worksheet, this is what you were talking about 15 Q. Okay. And during the pretest is a before as one of the forms that should always be common question you would ask about how the 16 16 17 filled out, correct? 17 individual was feeling? 18 MR. MILLER: Object. Misstates prior 18 A. Yes. 19 19 Q. All right. During the pretest is it testimony. common to ask questions about the education 20 THE WITNESS: Not always. 20 21 21 level of the individual? BY MS. SAMUELS: 22 Q. All right. When wouldn't this be 22 A. Yes. 23 23 filled out? Q. All right. During a pretest is it 24 A. When there's --24 common to ask questions about the employment

86 88 1 1 information prior to begin talking about the history of an individual? 2 A. Not the employment history. 2 case with them? 3 Q. Okay. 3 A. Actually, no. That was all given to 4 So, to my understanding, there 4 me from the detectives. 5 was no polygraph examiner's worksheet that was 5 Q. Okay. And so your normal practice in 6 6 started for Jovanie Long. Is that your May of 2000 would be to begin talking about the 7 understanding as well? 7 case during the pretest interview prior to 8 8 A. There is none, so it's my asking information about how they feel and their 9 9 understanding that we did not proceed to that name and asked for their information? 10 point in the pretest interview. 10 A. Yes. 11 Q. Okay. Is there something that comes 11 Q. Okay. And you see the -- I guess the 12 before asking questions, such as the subject's 12 numbers would indicate questions that are asked during the interview or during the examination. 13 name, in a pretest interview? 13 14 A. I'm sorry. I don't understand. Can 14 Is that fair to say? 15 you say that again, ma'am? 15 MR. MILLER: Object to foundation. 16 Q. Is there something that comes before 16 THE WITNESS: The numbers? 17 asking a subject's name in a pretest interview? 17 BY MS. SAMUELS: 18 18 A. Does what come before asking a Q. Yes. Can you --19 subject's name? 19 A. What numbers, ma'am? 20 20 Q. Like, is there anything that comes Q. Do you still see this sheet? before that in the pretest interview? 21 21 22 22 A. Is there anything -- yeah. I Q. Okay. And then there's, I think, 23 explained to you this before. 23 numbers 1 through 11 that are circled. Do you 24 Q. Okay. And so what comes before asking 24 see that? 87 89 1 1 the subject's name? A. There's numbers 1 through 8 and then 2 2 MR. MILLER: Objection to asked and number 11. Yes. 3 3 Q. Okay. Well, what do numbers 1 through 4 THE WITNESS: Once again, when, you 4 8 indicate to you? 5 5 know, I walk in there I introduce myself. I MR. MILLER: Object to foundation. 6 tell them who I am. I explain to them what 6 THE WITNESS: Those are the -- all the 7 7 they're doing there, that it's voluntary. They questions that are on -- that are written on fill out a consent form. They sign their names 8 8 this form are the questions that were asked 9 on the consent form so I know who they are from 9 during the polygraph examination, questions 1 10 the signature of the consent form. 10 through 8 and number 11. 11 I'm still not understanding 11 BY MS. SAMUELS: 12 the question very much. 12 Q. All right. Do you know why there's no 13 BY MS. SAMUELS: 13 questions nine or ten? 14 Q. Okay. So you consider the 14 A. Yes. 15 introduction and signing the consent form to be 15 Q. All right. Why is that? 16 part of the pretest interview? 16 A. Those spots are reserved for 17 A. Oh, absolutely. 17 additional relevant questions that could be 18 Q. Okay. And so based upon the lack of a 18 used, if necessary. And if they don't use them, 19 polygraph examiner's worksheet, can you make any they don't put them in. 19 Q. So it would be common to skip numbers 20 conclusions about how far you got into the 20 21 pretest interview with Jovanie Long? for the questions in a polygraph examination? 21 22 22 MR. MILLER: Object to form. A. No, I can't. 23 Q. Okay. And so did you have a normal 23 Foundation. 24 practice to ask people about their personal 24 THE WITNESS: Common to skip numbers?

23 (Pages 86 to 89)

90 92 1 MS. SAMUELS: Yeah. 1 BY MS. SAMUELS: 2 2 Q. Okay. Is it possible that questions THE WITNESS: I don't understand the 3 3 nine and ten were asked but they weren't written question. What do you mean? 4 BY MS. SAMUELS: 4 down? 5 Q. So it goes from eight to eleven, 5 A. No. 6 6 right? Q. Okay. Are you only supposed to write 7 7 A. Yes. down the questions that you ask someone during 8 8 Q. All right. And you would agree that the examination? 9 9 numbers nine and ten are skipped? MR. MILLER: Object to form. 10 10 THE WITNESS: Yes. 11 Q. So when you are conducting a polygraph 11 BY MS. SAMUELS: 12 examination, it would be common to see numbers 12 Q. All right. And do you see next to the 13 13 skipped. Is that fair to say? question where it says a plus or a minus in a 14 A. I don't know if it's common, but there 14 circle? 15 is -- there's always time when you don't 15 A. Yes. Q. What do you understand that to mean? 16 necessarily ask multiple questions, that if you 16 17 can get the questions that's the minimal -- of 17 A. That is the verbal answer that was 18 18 the minimal amount you don't have to ask five given by the subject in response to the question 19 relevant questions. 19 that was asked to him or her by the examiner. 20 20 Q. Right. O. Okay. And would you use that same 21 But my question is, if you --21 22 shorthand generally while you were -- for your so if you're only going to ask five questions 22 23 during a polygraph examination, is there ever a 23 polygraph examiner's worksheets? 24 reason not to use numbers one through five to 24 A. Yes. 91 93 1 indicate those questions? 1 Q. Okay. And do you see this sheet? 2 2 A. No, it's not. A. Yes. 3 Q. Okay. And so if I show one, three, 3 Q. All right. What did -- how do you differentiate between when questions are being 4 five -- one, three, five, seven, nine, right, 4 5 would that indicate to you that nine questions 5 asked on a sheet such as this? 6 6 were asked or five questions were asked? A. The numbers at the bottom of the page. 7 A. I still don't understand the question, 7 Q. Okay. So the number -- can you see 8 ma'am. I'm really -- you've got me lost here. 8 where my cursor is indicating? 9 9 Q. Sure. A. Yes. 10 10 Q. All right. What does that number And so my question is, can you 11 tell from this worksheet how many questions were 11 indicate to you? 12 12 A. I can't see that number. 13 A. Yes. 13 Q. Okay. Do you see the number where my Q. How many? cursor is indicating now? 14 14 15 A. Nine. 15 A. Yes. 16 16 Q. All right. What does that number mean Q. Nine. Okay. 17 And so because there's no 17 to you? 18 questions written down for nine and ten, that 18 A. That's number three. 19 means that no questions were asked? 19 Q. Number three? 20 A. Okay. 20 A. Yes. 21 Q. No. I'm asking you is that what it 21 Okay. Do you see the one next to the O. 22 22 means? three? 23 MR. MILLER: Object to foundation. 23 A. That's not a one. 24 THE WITNESS: Yes. 24 Q. What is that?

1	94		96
1	A. That is an indication by the examiner	1	Q. All right. 6-0 with a line under it,
2	as to when he started asking his questions	2	does that indicate anything to you?
3	verbally to the subject.	3	A. I believe the 60 dictates what the
4	Q. Okay. Got you.	4	blood pressure cuff pressure was at the end of
5	And so over here it looks like	5	the examination.
6	that's a 1-1?	6	Q. Okay. And then I'm sorry. I think
7	A. I can't tell being that close to the	7	it switched screens on me. It did. Sorry. I
8	edge of the paper, ma'am. You're giving me	8	think it switched screens.
9	partial charts here. You're giving me	9	Okay. And so this would
10	photocopies of stuff, and it's very hard to	10	indicate that this is the end of one
11	disseminate. I can't and to be quite honest	11	examination. Is that fair to say?
12	with you, it's unfair to have me do something	12	MR. MILLER: Object to foundation.
13	like this because I don't I wouldn't know	13	THE WITNESS: That would be the end of
14	what that is.	14	the test, yes.
15	Q. Do you see where my cursor is	15	BY MS. SAMUELS:
16	indicating where there's an M located?	16	Q. Okay. And because can you tell
17	A. Yes.	17	which examination this is?
18	Q. What do you understand that to mean?	18	A. No.
19	A. That's the examiner earmarking that	19	Q. Okay. Do you see this number printed
20	the subject made some type of movement, which	20	up here, the 1-2?
21	he did some kind of irregular thing to, excuse	21	A. Yes.
22	me, to the polygraph chart.	22	Q. What does that mean to you?
23	Q. Okay. And do you see the 1-6?	23	A. That is how many rolls how many
24	A. I see a 6.	24	speeds are left in the roll of paper that's
1 2	<ul><li>Q. You don't see a 1 next to the 6?</li><li>A. It's not a 1 next to the 6. That's</li></ul>	1 2	rolling off of the polygraph chart.  Q. Okay. So a higher number would
3	the earmark by the examiner as to when he	3	indicate that it that the that this is
4	started his question.	4	earlier in the examination?
5	Q. Got you. Okay.	5	A. Yeah.
6	And so that let's you know	6	
7	that he's starting question number 6. Is that	7	Q. Okay. THE WITNESS: Can we take a break?
8	fair to say?	8	MR. MILLER: Yeah. Can we take a
9	A. Yes, ma'am.	9	break?
10	Q. Okay. Do you see this underline or	10	MS. SAMUELS: Yeah. Five minutes?
11	this indication that's going horizontally?	11	MR. MILLER: Yeah, five is fine.
12	A. Yes.	12	(WHEREUPON, a brief recess
	Q. I'm sorry?	13	was held.)
1.5		1 ± J	was neru.
13 14	The state of the s	1	MS SAMIJEIS. Back on the record
14	A. Yes.	14	MS. SAMUELS: Back on the record.
14 15	A. Yes. Q. All right.	14 15	BY MS. SAMUELS:
14 15 16	A. Yes. Q. All right. What does that mean to you?	14 15 16	BY MS. SAMUELS: Q. Okay. And so I think when we left off
14 15 16 17	<ul><li>A. Yes.</li><li>Q. All right.</li></ul>	14 15 16 17	BY MS. SAMUELS:  Q. Okay. And so I think when we left off I was asking you about what certain things on a
14 15 16 17 18	A. Yes. Q. All right. What does that mean to you? A. That is the subject's verbal response where he actually responded to the question of	14 15 16 17 18	BY MS. SAMUELS: Q. Okay. And so I think when we left off I was asking you about what certain things on a polygraph chart meant; fair?
14 15 16 17 18 19	A. Yes. Q. All right. What does that mean to you? A. That is the subject's verbal response where he actually responded to the question of that to him on the examination.	14 15 16 17 18 19	BY MS. SAMUELS:  Q. Okay. And so I think when we left off I was asking you about what certain things on a polygraph chart meant; fair?  A. Uh-huh.
14 15 16 17 18 19	A. Yes. Q. All right. What does that mean to you? A. That is the subject's verbal response where he actually responded to the question of that to him on the examination. Q. Okay. And then do you see let me	14 15 16 17 18 19 20	BY MS. SAMUELS:  Q. Okay. And so I think when we left off I was asking you about what certain things on a polygraph chart meant; fair?  A. Uh-huh.  Q. Okay.
14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A. Yes.  Q. All right.  What does that mean to you?  A. That is the subject's verbal response where he actually responded to the question of that to him on the examination.  Q. Okay. And then do you see let me blow it up. Can you see this? It looks like	14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	BY MS. SAMUELS:  Q. Okay. And so I think when we left off I was asking you about what certain things on a polygraph chart meant; fair?  A. Uh-huh.  Q. Okay.  And so I'm showing you another
14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A. Yes.  Q. All right.  What does that mean to you?  A. That is the subject's verbal response where he actually responded to the question of that to him on the examination.  Q. Okay. And then do you see let me blow it up. Can you see this? It looks like it's 60 with a line under it and some maybe	14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	BY MS. SAMUELS:  Q. Okay. And so I think when we left off I was asking you about what certain things on a polygraph chart meant; fair?  A. Uh-huh.  Q. Okay.  And so I'm showing you another polygraph chart. This one at the top says "13,"
14 15 16 17 18 19 20	A. Yes.  Q. All right.  What does that mean to you?  A. That is the subject's verbal response where he actually responded to the question of that to him on the examination.  Q. Okay. And then do you see let me blow it up. Can you see this? It looks like	14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	BY MS. SAMUELS:  Q. Okay. And so I think when we left off I was asking you about what certain things on a polygraph chart meant; fair?  A. Uh-huh.  Q. Okay.  And so I'm showing you another

98 100 1 1 Q. So that would seem to indicate that there, that's him moving the needle up. That this -- these readings happened before the one 2 2 straight line on the cardio, that's him actually 3 3 on 12; is that fair? manipulating charts. What's underneath I don't 4 A. Yes. 4 see -- I can't -- you'll have to ask him. 5 Q. Okay. And then at the bottom it says 5 BY MS. SAMUELS: 6 6 number -- or it looks like the "#3 MQ" and then O. Fine. circled. Do you see that? A. I don't know what exactly the question 7 7 8 8 A. Yes. is. 9 Q. All right. What does that indicate or 9 Q. And when you move the chart up, what 10 10 does that mean? mean to you? 11 A. That indicates that it is the third 11 A. That means that you are manually 12 manipulating the chart yourself so that it 12 examination that is being administered in this becomes -- so that it goes higher into the 13 series, and the MQ stands for mixed question. 13 14 Q. All right. What's a mixed question? 14 section where it won't go -- the pen stops 15 A. Instead of asking the questions in the 15 because this is a pen making the chart 16 16 order that he had previously done, he's recording. 17 17 alternating the order of the questions that he's Q. Okay. Would that affect the reading 18 18 at all? asking. 19 Q. Okay. Was that a standard practice? 19 A. No. He's earmarked it. He's putting A. Yes. 20 20 it on the charts that I did this. This is my Q. All right. Is there a reason you 21 21 manipulation of this. might alternate the order of questions? 22 22 Q. Okay. And so do you see where my 23 A. Yes. 23 cursor is indicating? 24 Q. All right. And why is that? 24 A. Yes. 99 101 A. To determine whether or not the 1 Q. All right. Can you read that and tell 1 2 2 position in which you ask each individual me what that indicates to you. 3 question during the test could elicit a 3 A. I believe that's -- I believe, now, 4 response. So by switching the positions of the 4 like I said, his writing is -- I believe that's 5 5 questions up, you're eliminating that problem. question number four. 6 6 Q. Okay. And do you see where my cursor Q. Okay. And then the 80 over 60, that 7 7 is indicating? would be the blood pressure? 8 A. Yes. 8 A. Yes. 9 Q. Okay. And it looks like it's got that 9 Q. All right. Can you see where my 10 sort of demarcation line with the eight and a 10 cursor is indicating? 11 horizontal line going under it, correct? 11 A. Yes. 12 12 Q. Can you read that and tell me what 13 13 Q. All right. What does that indicate to that indicates to you? 14 A. That is the 20. That means the 14 you? 15 A. Question eight. 15 sensitivity unit that he has put this particular 16 16 Q. Okay. And then to the immediate left, examination on, the 20 sensitivity unit. 17 do you see where my cursor is indicating? 17 Q. Okay. Does that indicate a change or 18 A. Yes. 18 just what the number is? 19 Q. All right. Can you read that and tell 19 A. No idea. 20 me what it indicates to you? 20 Q. Okay. Why might you indicate what the 21 A. I don't know. 21 sensitivity is in that examination? MR. MILLER: Object to foundation. A. So that you know what your sensitivity 22 22 23 23 THE WITNESS: I can't -- I can't -- I is. So -- I mean, if you put it down to zero, 24 know the one part, the one top is -- that right 24 you're going to get a straight line during the

26 (Pages 98 to 101)

102 104 1 1 polygraph or -- so by pulling it up to a number in a circle, like is indicated here, would you generally expect that to mean the 2 sensitivity of 20, you can then have some kind 2 3 3 reading or the sensitivity of the machine? of -- you could show some kind of reaction. 4 Q. Okay. All right. And then I'm 4 MR. MILLER: Same objection. 5 showing you a graph, and at the top it says 5 THE WITNESS: It could be the 6 "16," correct? 6 sensitivity. It could be the pressure on the 7 A. Uh-huh. 7 cuff. It could be the number of tests that 8 8 Q. All right. And there looks to be some you're running. 9 9 handwriting, and this is just the name of the BY MS. SAMUELS: 10 individual on this graph, correct? 10 Q. Okay. MR. MILLER: Object to foundation. 11 11 All right. Do you see this, 12 THE WITNESS: Okay. 12 what I'm indicating at the bottom left in the 13 BY MS. SAMUELS: 13 circle right here? 14 Q. Well, I'm guessing, would you -- did 14 A. Yes. 15 you have a common practice of writing on a graph 15 Q. Can you read that and tell me what you 16 the name of the individual being examined? 16 understand that to mean? 17 A. Yes. 17 A. Test chart. 18 Q. Okay. And the date indicated here, 18 Q. That's what? 19 was it your common practice to indicate the date 19 A. Test chart. 20 the examination was occurring? 20 Q. I'm sorry. I can't hear you. 21 A. Yes. 21 A. Test chart. 22 Q. Okay. And then it looks like an F 22 O. What does that mean? 23 dash and a bunch of numbers. Do you know what 23 A. It means he created a test chart prior 24 that would generally be used to indicate? 24 to actually administering the examination. 103 105 1 Q. All right. What's a test chart? 1 A. I would assume that was the RD number. 2 2 Q. Okay. And it looks like the initials. A. It's about twenty, thirty seconds that Would that generally be used to indicate the 3 3 you have everything running the way it's 4 person who's conducting the examination? 4 supposed to to make sure that the machine is 5 5 A. I believe that's him. working properly, that you have proper amplitude 6 6 and sensitivity for the person you're giving the Q. Okay. And then under the first line, 7 7 it looks like there's an X where my cursor is examination to. 8 8 indicating. Do you see that? Q. Okay. Was it your common practice to 9 A. Uh-huh. 9 have a test chart? 10 Q. Okay. Do you know what that would 10 A. Yes. 11 generally be used to indicate? 11 Q. Okay. And test charts, are they always done before you begin an examination? 12 A. Yeah. Like I previously stated 12 13 before, he manipulated the charts himself, so he 13 A. Yes. 14 Q. All right. Is there ever a time when 14 put an X there. 15 Q. Okay. And so is it fair to say any 15 you would do a test chart in the middle of an 16 time you see an X indicated on a chart like this 16 examination or between two examinations? 17 that would suggest that there's been some type 17 A. No. 18 of manipulation to the machine doing the 18 Q. Okay. 19 19 A. Well, if you had -- if you had reading? MR. MILLER: Object to foundation. 20 20 something where one of the -- one of the 21 attachments fell off, sometimes that happens, 21 Calls for speculation. 22 THE WITNESS: Most likely, yes. 22 they roll, then you would have to put it back on 23 BY MS. SAMUELS: 23 and, you know, maybe do a test -- a little test 24 Q. Okay. And when you see sort of then a 2.4 chart there. Or you would just make sure that

106 108 1 1 be the test chart, correct? the one parameter that you fixed is working 2 2 A. Usually, yes, for the most part. For properly. 3 3 the most part, the first chart is the test chart But for the most part, in 4 4 general, no, you would just do a test chart at to determine the person is responding and you're 5 the beginning. 5 getting good recordings, yes. 6 Q. Okay. 6 Q. Okay. Is there a way you would 7 7 All right. And so because -generally expect a test chart to look? 8 8 A. It would look -- well, I don't how can you tell if you're looking at a complete 9 9 chart for a polygraph examination? understand your question. It's going to look 10 10 A. Well, the blood pressure turns on, all like the recordings on the polygraph machine. 11 the questions are listed on the bottom, and then 11 Q. Okay. Do you see this area 12 12 indicated -- I'm sorry. Do you see this the blood pressure turns off. 13 13 indicated right here? It looks like the line Q. Okay. So looking at this chart now, 14 is this the first chart for this examination? 14 and then a number with that horizontal line 15 MR. MILLER: Object to foundation. 15 going under it? 16 16 Calls for speculation. A. Yes. 17 THE WITNESS: This is part of the 17 Q. What would that indicate to you? 18 18 A. Question three. first examination. 19 BY MS. SAMUELS: 19 Q. Okay. And if that's a question -- are 20 Q. Okay. Is this the highest number we 20 these charts read left to right or right to have? So this is the highest number we have. 21 21 22 Based upon the readings, would 22 A. Left to right. 23 this indicate that this is the first chart or 23 Q. Okay. And so can you tell where the 24 was -- is there a page before this? 24 test period on this chart ends? 107 109 1 1 A. No. A. No. This is the beginning. This is 2 2 Q. Okay. Can you tell where the test his beginning of his chart. It has the person's period on this chart begins? 3 name, the date, the test chart, the first 3 4 straight group of tests is about to begin and 4 A. Yes. 5 5 Q. Okay. Where does it begin? has begun. 6 6 Q. All right. So do you know it's the A. Where the number one, and it says 7 first chart because this is where her name is 7 number one, ST and it's circled. And then the 8 written or based upon these lines? 8 straight line on the cardio or the blood 9 A. Based upon the fact that there's a 9 pressure cuff starts up and then you start 10 10 number one. getting recordings there. 11 Q. Okay. And so can you tell a first 11 Q. Okay. So am I indicating correctly chart based upon any of the readings indicated, 12 where this chart -- where the evaluation begins? 12 or would it always be based upon the writings of 13 13 A. Yes. 14 Q. Okay. And so about three-quarters of 14 the examiner? 15 A. Okay. I'm a little confused, 15 the way it begins, and then that period before 16 it is that test period. Fair enough? 16 Counselor. 17 You want me to know if I can 17 A. Yes. 18 look at this -- if I can look at the parameters 18 Q. Okay. Got you. Do you have any recollection 19 and see whether or not this is the first 19 about any of your interactions with Jovanie Long 20 examination without looking at any of the 20 21 markings the examiner made. No, I can't do 21 in this matter? 22 that. 22 A. No. 23 23 Q. Okay. Q. All right. Do you have any reason to 24 And so the first chart should 24 dispute Jovanie Long's recitation of his

110 112 1 interactions with you? 1 Q. Okay. Do you know why you're involved 2 A. I'm sorry? 2 in this lawsuit? Q. Do you have any reason to dispute --3 MR. MILLER: Object to form and to the 3 4 MR. MILLER: Object to form. 4 extent that it calls for attorney-client 5 Foundation. 5 privileged information. 6 6 BY MS. SAMUELS: Go ahead and answer to the 7 Q. Do you have any reason to dispute 7 extent you can. 8 Johnny -- Jovanie Long's recitation of his 8 THE WITNESS: Actually, no. 9 9 interactions with you? BY MS. SAMUELS: 10 MR. MILLER: Object to form. 10 Q. Are you aware of anybody confessing to THE WITNESS: Well, if you want to crimes to you where they were later exonerated? 11 11 12 tell me what that was because I don't know what 12 A. Where they were later exonerated? his recitation of his interaction with me was. 13 13 Q. Yes. 14 BY MS. SAMUELS: 14 A. No. 15 Q. Okay. 15 Q. Are you aware of anyone confessing to 16 16 any crime to you when they were later found not When you talk with an individual during the pretest interview, you say 17 guilty or the charges were dropped? 17 18 you talk to them about the facts of the case and 18 A. Yes. 19 why they're there? 19 Q. All right. How many times? 20 A. I inform them, yes. 20 A. I believe one I know. 21 Q. Okay. Do you ever talk about the 21 O. When was that? 22 22 possible consequences of a conviction or A. It was awhile back. 23 anything like that? 23 Q. How long is awhile? 24 A. No. I don't think -- I don't think 24 A. Like, years. 111 113 1 1 I've ever done that. Q. What do you recall about that case? 2 2 Q. All right. But if somebody is there A. He killed his next door neighbor. He 3 because they're a suspect in a murder, you would confessed to killing his next door neighbor. He 3 4 let them know that? 4 confessed to myself and two other detectives. 5 5 A. Yeah. And as luck would have it, by 6 Q. Do you talk to people during the 6 the time he got back to the Area there was a 7 7 pretest interview to make sure they understand lawyer and he never gave any other statement the effects of a polygraph examination? 8 8 other than that. 9 MR. MILLER: Object to form. 9 Q. And, to your knowledge, the charges 10 THE WITNESS: What do you mean by the 10 were eventually dropped against him? 11 11 A. He was found not guilty. word "effects?" 12 BY MS. SAMUELS: 12 Q. Okay. 13 Q. Like what it -- what it would mean how 13 When he confessed to you, was 14 14 that during the examination? their results are read? 15 A. How their results are read? I 15 A. That was immediately upon me entering 16 don't -- once again, I don't necessarily 16 the room, yes. 17 understand your question. Can you rephrase it, 17 Q. Okay. So even before the pretest? 18 please? 18 A. I'm sorry? 19 19 Q. I said so that was before the pretest Q. Sure. 20 Do you let people know that 20 interview? 21 after they give a polygraph examination you're 21 A. Yes. No, that was during the pre --22 going to be able to tell whether they're being 22 that was during the -- during the interview 23 deceptive or not? 23 before the test. 24 A. Yes. 24 Q. Okay. Do you still hold an opinion

114 116 1 one way or another regarding that individual's 1 BY MS. SAMUELS: 2 confession he gave to you? 2 Q. Right. 3 A. Yes. 3 So I'm talking about when --4 Q. What's your opinion? 4 like, once they bring a person in for a 5 A. He killed her. 5 polygraph, right, and they are at 11th and State 6 Q. Okay. Is that -- do you remember the 6 and they are -- right. And so you do the 7 name of that individual? 7 paperwork that says the time that they're in, 8 8 A. Donnie McGee. 9 9 Q. Okay. Do you remember any other After they're brought in, was instances where someone confessed to you and 10 10 it usual to have detectives talk to a person they were later found not guilty or the 11 11 who's brought in for a polygraph? 12 charges -- had the charges dropped? 12 MR. MILLER: Object to form. 13 A. Now, when you say "charges dropped," THE WITNESS: I don't know the word 13 14 this is the criminal charges? 14 "usual" is correct. There are times when 15 Q. Yes, sir. 15 detectives will go in and talk to the subject, 16 16 A. I think it was Danny Lonza. He didn't 17 17 BY MS. SAMUELS: confess to me. 18 Q. Can you tell me about that? 18 Q. All right. It would just depend on 19 A. Danny Lonza was brought in by a 19 the detective? 20 detective. It was an interpreter case. And 20 A. Excuse me? 21 Q. It would just depend on the detective? during the course of the detective talking to 21 22 A. The detectives, the circumstances, the 22 Danny Lonza, prior to administering the test, he 23 confessed to the detective in Spanish about what 23 situation. 24 he had done. 24 Q. All right. 115 117 1 Under what circumstances or 1 From what I understand, he 2 2 situations would you expect to have a detective fled the country years later. Somebody else 3 3 decided to confess to a bunch of number of talk to someone at the polygraph unit but before 4 taking the polygraph examination? 4 things and decided to include this one in it as 5 5 A. I've had detectives come in who well. 6 have -- they -- they have not yet sat down and 6 Q. Okay. Was it common to have 7 talked to any individual. So they, you know, 7 detectives talk to the person being examined 8 scheduled the polygraph. However, before 8 before conducting the polygraph? 9 9 MR. MILLER: Object to form. they -- before they gave it they sat down and 10 10 they interviewed them. Foundation. 11 11 Q. Okay. THE WITNESS: I don't know when 12 detectives talk to people. I mean, if they are 12 A. And then after the interview, then in the Area in the interview rooms, detectives 13 they offered the polygraph to them. 13 14 Q. So sometimes detectives would 14 are talking to them. 15 BY MS. SAMUELS: 15 interview people at the polygraph unit? 16 A. It wasn't inside the polygraph room, 16 Q. Yes. 17 But specifically for someone 17 but sometimes they would have them meet there, 18 who's coming for a polygraph examination, is it 18 they would sit outside. They would talk to them usual to have detectives talk to that person? 19 or they would -- they would go to their office. 19 MR. MILLER: Same objection. 20 20 They would meet them at their office. They had 21 THE WITNESS: I can't control what 21 the polygraph already scheduled. They said, I detectives do in the Area or in squad cars 22 got this case and the gentleman's meeting me 22 23 here at 5:00 o'clock. I'm going to interview 23 bringing them down. 24 24 him. I'm going to offer him a polygraph

118 120 1 examination. Can I make the appointment for 1 MR. MILLER: Object to form. 2 7:30. Okay. 2 BY MS. SAMUELS: 3 3 So the detective would talk to Q. Yes. 4 him. I would know that. The detective would 4 A. I do polygraph examinations. I'm not 5 talk to him and then he would bring him down to 5 there for them to do their investigations. 6 6 Q. Okay. 7 Q. All right. If a detective is talking 7 And so was there a holding 8 to a person who's already been brought to you 8 cell or place where individuals could be brought 9 for a polygraph examination, would you note or 9 when they're at the polygraph station or, I 10 indicate that anywhere? guess, that area that was separate and apart 10 11 MR. MILLER: Object to the incomplete from the polygraph examination room? 11 A. Holding cell, no. 12 nature of the hypothetical. 12 Q. Okay. And so if a person was being 13 THE WITNESS: I don't see any reason 13 14 why I would. 14 brought for a polygraph examination, you would 15 BY MS. SAMUELS: 15 expect them to either be held in the polygraph 16 Q. Okay. 16 examination room? 17 When a person has been brought 17 MR. MILLER: Object to form. 18 for a polygraph examination and a detective 18 THE WITNESS: Yes. 19 wants to speak with him, would you be present or 19 BY MS. SAMUELS: 20 would they be allowed to speak with that 20 Q. Okay. Is there any --21 individual alone? 21 A. They would --22 A. When would the detective want to speak 22 MR. MILLER: Go ahead and finish. 23 to him? I don't understand the question. 23 THE WITNESS: They would be sitting in 24 Q. Right. 24 the chair waiting for me to come in where the 119 121 So you said sometimes 1 1 polygraph was at. 2 2 detectives would speak to somebody who had been BY MS. SAMUELS: 3 brought in for a polygraph unit. Either 3 Q. All right. Is there any place you 4 sometimes they might speak with them in the 4 would expect someone to wait who has been 5 5 room, sometimes they might sit outside the room brought in for a polygraph examination? 6 and talk to them, right? 6 A. Expect them to wait. That's a very 7 7 A. Well, I have never had them -- I general question, Counselor. Are they -- are 8 8 have -- I can say for sure that I have never had they in custody, are they not in custody, are 9 9 them sitting in the room where the polygraph is they early, are they late, you know. 10 talking to them prior to being administered. I 10 I don't necessarily -- I can't 11 11 mean, unless -- let me put it -- unless they answer that question. It's too broad. 12 were requested by the person. You know, 12 O. Okay. 13 detective, can I talk to you or something. 13 So if a person is in custody, right, and they're being brought for a polygraph 14 14 15 But I don't -- I'm not in that 15 examination, during the time when you're talking 16 16 with the detectives and they're telling you room with them at that point. I don't need to 17 17 about why they need you to question that person, 18 Q. Okay. And so do they ever talk to 18 is there anyplace besides the polygraph 19 witnesses in your office? Or I shouldn't say 19 examination room where you would expect to find 20 witnesses. The person who's being brought for 20 the person who's being subjected to the the polygraph examination, would they ever use 21 21 polygraph examination? 22 your office to talk to someone? 22 A. We have no other place to put any 23 A. Would they bring them in -- instead of 23 individual other than that. 24 going to their own -- to their own office? 24 Q. Okay. And then how were you

	122		124
1	implicated in the I think you said his name	1	said to Jovanie Long?
2	was Lonza. You said he didn't confess to you,	2	A. No.
3	correct?	3	Q. Do you remember any words that Jovanie
4	A. I don't speak Spanish and the	4	Long said to you?
5	confession he made to the detective was in	5	A. No.
6	Spanish.	6	Q. Do you remember how Jovanie Long
7	Q. Okay. Were you there?	7	looked?
8	A. Yes.	8	A. No, ma'am. I don't.
9	Q. Okay. So if I'm understanding you	9	Q. Do you remember anything about Jovanie
10	correctly, he came in to do a polygraph	10	Long's demeanor?
11	examination; is that correct?	11	A. No, ma'am.
12	A. Yes.	12	Q. Do you remember anything about Jovanie
13	Q. Can you just explain to me briefly	13	Long's appearance or his state?
14	what happened because I'm confused, with Danny	14	A. No, ma'am.
15	Lonza.	15	Q. Okay. Do you remember any words you
16	A. He was brought in. He doesn't speak	16	told to the detectives regarding Jovanie Long?
17	English. There was a detective there with him	17	A. No, I don't.
18	who was serving as my interpreter. And while I	18	
19	was talking to him and he was talking to	19	Q. Do you know any words that said do
	-	20	you recall anything the detectives told you
20 21	Mr. Lonza, they started a conversation. And the		regarding Jovanie Long?
	conversation looked like it was progressing, at	21	A. At this moment in time, no.
22	which time I was informed by Mr well, by the	22	Q. All right. Is there something that
23	detective that he had confessed to whatever	23	might refresh your recollection?
24	the I think it was it was a child sexual	24	A. No, ma'am.
	123		125
1	abuse or assault.	1	MR. MILLER: Object to form.
2	Q. Okay. And so	2	BY MS. SAMUELS:
3	A. So at that point at that point	3	Q. Do you recall which detectives you
4	there was I was no longer necessary.	4	spoke to regarding Jovanie Long?
5	Q. Okay. And so, essentially, a	5	A. I'm assuming that, based on my
6	detective was serving as your interpreter for	6	paperwork, that I had talked to a detective I
7	the pretest part?	7	think it's Pietryla. I think Detective
8	A. Yes.	8	Pietryla or Pietrylka I don't know. All I
9	Q. Okay. And then during that you noted	9	all I based on the paperwork of my polygraph
10	that they're sort of just having their own	10	sheet.
11	conversation, and then you learned later that he	11	Q. Okay.
12	confesses when they were talking?	12	Is it fair to say you do not
13	A. Yes.	13	have a recollection of talking with any
14	MS. SAMUELS: Okay. I think I'm just	14	detective?
15	about done with you, sir. Give me, like, five,	15	A. I'm sorry. I didn't hear the last
16	ten minutes to look over my notes. Come back at	16	word. Ma'am, you cut out.
17	1:00 o'clock. Is that fair?	17	MR. MILLER: I think she kicked the
18	THE WITNESS: Yes. Sure.	18	microphone or something.
19	MS. SAMUELS: Okay.	19	THE WITNESS: Is that her?
20	(WHEREUPON, a brief recess	20	MR. MILLER: No. She just went
21	was held.)	21	underneath the desk.
22	*	22	MS. ADEEYO: Can we go off the record.
22	MS. SAMUELS: Back on the record. BY MS. SAMUELS:	23	MS. ADELYO: Can we go off the record.  MR. MILLER: Okay.
2.2			IVIK. IVIII LEK! UKAV.
23		1	internizzzie onaș.
23 24	Q. Do you remember any words that you	24	

	126		128
1	(WHEREUPON, a brief recess	1	record?
2	was held.)	2	THE REPORTER: Yes.
3	MS. SAMUELS: Okay. I'm back. I	3	BY MS. SAMUELS:
4	don't know what happened. Are we still on the	4	Q. Is there anyplace else you would
5	record?	5	record your findings for in relation to a
6	THE REPORTER: Yes. We're back on the	6	polygraph besides the I think it was called
7	record.	7	the cover sheet.
8		8	A. No, I don't believe so.
9	MS. SAMUELS: Okay. Thank you. BY MS. SAMUELS:		,
10		9	Q. Okay. Is there anything else in
11	Q. Is it fair to say that you know you		relation to your interactions with Jovanie Long
	talked to Pietryla based upon the report you	11	that you recall that we haven't testified
12	reviewed, but you don't have an independent	12	about that you haven't testified about
13	recollection of talking to him?	13	already?
14	A. I believe that would be the case.	14	MR. MILLER: Object to form.
15	Yes.	15	THE WITNESS: I don't believe so, no.
16	Q. Okay. Do you have any recollection of	16	MS. SAMUELS: Okay. No further
17	any information you shared regarding Jovanie	17	questions.
18	Long to anyone?	18	MS. ADEEYO: I have nothing based on
19	A. I have no recollection.	19	that.
20	Q. And my understanding is you would have	20	MR. MILLER: I have, like, three
21	given the officers an oral report and then you	21	questions.
22	would have sent them the case you would	22	CROSS-EXAMINATION
23	have and then you would have sent them the	23	BY MR. MILLER:
24	polygraph cover; is that fair?	24	Q. So, Mr. Bartik, earlier you testified
	127		129
1	A. Yes, ma'am.	1	that you had testified at Jovanie Long's
2	Q. Okay. Is there anywhere else you	2	criminal trial. Was it actually the trial
3	would write up your findings or no, bad	3	itself or was it a suppression hearing that you
4	question.	4	testified at?
5	Is there anywhere else you	5	A. It was a suppression hearing. It was
6	would expect that you would record your	6	not the trial. I never testified at a trial.
7	findings related to a polygraph examination?	7	Q. Okay. And did you ever testify at any
8	A. I don't believe so.	8	criminal proceeding with regard to Xavier
9	(Technical difficulties.)	9	Walker?
10	Did we lose her again?	10	A. No.
11	THE REPORTER: Ms. Samuels, we can't	11	Q. Did you have any involvement in
12	hear you.	12	obtaining the confession of Xavier Walker in
13	MR. MILLER: You're on mute. What's	13	this matter?
14	going on?	14	A. No.
15	THE WITNESS: I don't know what's	15	MR. MILLER: Those are the only
16	going on.	16	questions I have.
17	MR. MILLER: Do you know that you're	17	Is there anything else from
18	on mute, Jeanette?	18	anybody?
19	(Technical difficulties.)	19	MS. SAMUELS: No.
20	MS. SAMUELS: Can you hear me okay? I	20	THE REPORTER: Signature?
21	don't know why I keep getting locked out.	21	MR. MILLER: We will reserve
22	MR. MILLER: Now we can hear you.	22	signature, and we can go off the record.
23	THE WITNESS: Now we can hear you.	23	(WHEREUPON, the deposition
24	MS. SAMUELS: Are we back on the	24	concluded at 1:08 p.m.)
			<del>-</del> ·

33 (Pages 126 to 129)

		130		132
1	IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT		1	ERRATA SHEET
2	FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ILLINOIS EASTERN DIVISION		2	Examination of: Robert Bartik
3	EASTERN DIVISION			Date taken: 6-15-22
4	XAVIER WALKER, )		3	
5	Plaintiff, )		4	Page Line
_	) N- 20 GV 7200		5	Change:
6	vs. ) No. 20 CV 7209		6	Reason:
7	CITY OF CHICAGO, et al., ) Judge Guzman		7	Change:
8	Defendants. )		8	Reason:
9 10	T1 1 20 d (T1 1d		9 10	Change:
10	I hereby certify that I have read the foregoing transcript of my deposition given on		11	Reason:
11	June 15, 2022, consisting of pages 1 through		12	Change: Reason:
12	133, inclusive, and I do again subscribe and make oath that the same is a true, correct and		13	Change:
4.0	complete transcript of my deposition given as		14	Reason:
13	aforesaid, with corrections, if any, appearing on the attached correction sheet(s).		15	Change:
14	.,		16	Reason:
15	Correction sheet(s) attached.		17	Change:
16			18	Reason:
17 18	ROBERT BARTIK		19	Change:
19			20	Reason:
20	Subscribed and sworn to before me this day		21	Change:
	of, 2022.		22	Reason:
21 22			23	Deponent's
23	Notary Public		24	SignatureDate
		131		133
1	ERRATA SHEET		1	STATE OF ILLINOIS )
2	Examination of: Robert Bartik			) SS:
	Date taken: 6-15-22		2	COUNTY OF C O O K )
3	р. т.		3	
4 5	Page Line		4	I, DONNA WADLINGTON SHAVERS, a
6	Change:		5	Certified Shorthand Reporter within and for the
7	Reason: Change:		6	County of Cook and State of Illinois, do hereby
8	Reason:		7 8	certify that heretofore, to-wit, on the 15th of
9	Change:		9	June, 2022, remotely appeared before me via Zoom videoconferencing, in the City of Chicago,
10	Reason:		10	County of Cook and State of Illinois, ROBERT
11	Change:		11	BARTIK, produced as a witness for examination in
12	Reason:		12	said cause.
13	Change:		13	I further certify that the
14	Reason:		14	said witness, ROBERT BARTIK, was by me first
15	Change:		15	duly sworn to testify the truth, the whole truth
16	Reason:		16	and nothing but the truth in the cause aforesaid
17	Change:		17	before the taking of the examination under oath;
18 19	Reason:		18	that the testimony was reduced to writing in the
20	Change:		19	presence of said witness by means of machine
21	Reason:		20	shorthand and afterwards transcribed into
22	Change: Reason:		21	typewriting, and that the foregoing is a true
23	Deponent's		22	and correct transcript of the testimony given by
	Signature Date		23	said witness.
24			24	I further certify that I am

34 (Pages 130 to 133)

